
HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed, Mayor

The seal of the City and County of San Francisco is a large, faint, circular watermark in the background. It features an eagle with spread wings perched atop a shield. The shield is divided into four quadrants, each containing a different symbol. The words "SEAL OF THE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO" are written around the perimeter of the seal. Below the shield, there is a banner with the words "ORO EN PAZ" and "FIERRO EN GUERRA".

African American Reparations Advisory Committee

Draft Meeting Transcription

December 12, 2022

5:30 p.m.

For more information, contact the Commission Secretary at 415-252-2500
Agenda and other information are available on the HRC website: www.sfgov.org/sfhumanrights

00:04

Good evening, everyone. We will call to order this meeting of the African American Reparations Advisory Committee. Again, we appreciate you joining and committee chair Eric McDonnell. All as always appreciate the excuse me support that we receive and have continued to receive from the Human Rights Commission staff, led by Director Davis, and supported by manager Juell Stewart, Zachary Manuel and Anjeanette coats and director Brittini Chicuata. Thank you all. John McKnight, Amelia Martinez Bankhead and Angelique Mahan and Secretary Mulkey Meyer for the fantastic support that we are receiving tonight. With that Secretary Mulkey Meyer, do you have any announcements?

00:58

Good evening chair. Yes, I do. This evening's meeting is being held remotely public comment will be available on each item on this agenda. Each speaker will be allowed three minutes to speak people attending if you are calling in please mute your phone and use raise hand icons or Q&A feature to indicate you to participate in public comment

01:51

Sorry I got static on my end, Secretary might was last thing that you said that people should use the raise hand icon to indicate they would like to participate in public comment. Okay, let's move to the first item. Roll call please.

02:09

1. CALL TO ORDER AND COMMITTEE ROLL CALL (*Action Item*)

Item number one is roll call. I will announce committee Members names they will announce their Present James Lance Taylor; Tinisch Hollins Present; Eric McDonnell Present; Rev Dr. Amos Brown present; Rico Hamilton; Nikole Cunningham present; Gloria Berry present; Daniel Landry present; Tiffany Carter. Tiffany Carter present; Gwendolyn Brown present; Anietie Ekanem present; Star Williams present; Shakeyla O'Cain; Laticia Erving present; and I believe I saw Member Taylor is Member Taylor I see waving Thank you. Oh, the meeting can come to order. We do have quorum.

03:30

2. LAND AND ANCESTRAL ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS (*Discussion Item*)

Excellent. Thank you very much. We can now move to the Land and Ancestral Acknowledgments. First, thank you to Member Erving for reading the ancestral acknowledgement and following thank you to Member Cunningham for reading the land acknowledgement.

03:47

Ancestral acknowledgement. We honor the gifts, resilience and sacrifices of our Black ancestors, particularly those who toiled the land and built the institutions that establish this city's wealth and freedom. Despite never being compensated nor fully realizing their own sovereignty. We acknowledge this exploitation of not only labor, but our humanity and through this process, we are working to repair

some of the harms done by public and private actors. Because of their work. We are here and will invest in the descendants of their legacy. Thank you. Member Cunningham. Thank you,

04:27

Ramaytush Ohlone Land Acknowledgement. We acknowledged that we are on the unseeded ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone, who are the original inhabitants of San Francisco peninsula. As an indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the raw materials alone, excuse me, have never ceded loss nor forgotten their responsibilities as caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory, as guests, we recognize that we benefit from the living and working benefit from living and working on their traditional home then we wish to pay our respects by acknowledging our ancestors, elders and relatives, now the raw materials community, and by affirming their sovereign rights as first.

05:28

3. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT (*Discussion Item*)

Members of the public may address the Advisory Committee on matters that are within the Reparations jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Thank you so much. We can move now to Item three, please. Item three is public comment. Members of the public may address the committee on matters that are within the committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda. You can use the raise hand icon; each public commenter will be provided three minutes and I do see a hand raised. Cynthia Marie, welcome. Marie, can you unmute yourself.

06:13

Thank you, I didn't realize I was muted. Thank you. This, these matters may have already been discussed. And I apologize if they have been, but they popped into my head recently. The first is that Reparations should be for individuals whose family Members have lived in San Francisco and are descendants of enslaved Americans. That's number one. Number two, ideally, an office would be set up to establish people to help confirm their heritage through the city and county of San Francisco, or a nonprofit. Number three, thank you for putting the agenda in the chat box because I was unable to find it. Number four, I'd like to express appreciation for all the work you all are doing. That's it. Thank you.

07:03

Thank you. Now I would like to welcome Lorna Hopkins. Can you unmute yourself?

07:14

Yes, I finally did see the unmute. This is my first time actually using zoom and, I appreciate you all giving us an opportunity. My concerns are about technology, uploading documents and paperwork, such as documents and photos, I believe that technology people that you're going to hire should have the knowledge on jpg, PDF, and giving people choices on what they can upload. If you're going to be doing ID checks, like a lot of companies do, then we you should look at experience companies that have been business for many, many years that no technology and can troubleshoot any new technology. Customer service workers that you're going to be using to I don't know talk speak or handout applications, I believe should be knowledgeable of the needs of the people that they're going

to be talking to. I believe there should be a self-help line established for people that are going to be going down memory lane in history Lane sometimes for the first time in their lives. And there's going to be certain triggers that's going to be going on in their minds. And maybe they might not be able to participate or help. But I think it would be important if we look at those issues and thank you for your time.

08:58

Thank you. Now I'd like to welcome Josiah Williams.

09:06

Please, oh, 'm sorry. I'm just trying to confirm. Can you hear me? Yes. Thank you. Okay. Hello. Thank you. I appreciate being here. And also, for the work that you're doing. I look forward to seeing, you know, as many of you as possible at the California Reparations taskforce meeting. I know Dr. Brown will be here. I just wanted to come in, you know, briefly regarding like some of the residency requirements. My father grew up in San Francisco. I have an older cousin that lives there now. Um, so you know, their parents lived there before them. I just wanted to mention, it may be kind of difficult. I know that some of the records weren't accurate when it came to, we have a lot of different theories already in place. So, I just wanted to put out there that you know, other cases, records weren't accurate. And, the names of some of the residents weren't there. I know this would also be difficult if the same situation happened in Oklahoma because my family live where there is a post office now. So, there may not be as many records so it could kind of prevent some people who actually are doing justice. So, I just want to point that out and say, I appreciate your work on this matter. Thank you.

10:28

Thank you. Could I please welcome Phyllis Shulman. Can you unmute?

10:38

Yes, yes, thank you for reminding me that. I am a psychotherapist in San Francisco. I also helped organize the workshop, the forum of Reparations that Eric McDonnell and Reverend Brown appeared at in San Francisco at church with Israel a few months back in a conversation with my colleague, Dr. Clifton Hicks, who is works with children and families at Southeast child, Southeast Family Child center mental health center in the city, it's a public mental health clinic. One of the things that he expressed concerned about is that there is no mental health, community mental health center that's dedicated to work with African American patients. There's a clinic in the mission that's primarily devoted to Hispanics, there's a clinic in North Beach, in you know that in Chinatown that's mostly concerned about Chinese Americans. But there is no such clinic in the city that is specifically geared to the issues of African American children and families. So, I would like that to be incorporated here. And I would like to see that incorporated in the plan for mental health, that there be a designated clinic that's geared to African American families. And he has the idea that his clinic, the Southeast Child Family Center, would have a way would have a way of accommodating that result. But there needs to be some proposal to make that possible. So, I just wanted to respectfully add that. Thank you.

12:40

Thank you. Now I'd like to welcome Alyssa Jones Gardner. Thank you. And thank you to all the Members of the committee.

12:52

My name is Alyssa Jones, Garner. And I spoke actually work for the City and County of San Francisco as well. First one of the comments that was made about access, technological access for people for our people that are going to be applying for Reparations, that is a very serious concern. Because there is not a lot of access, especially in communities like in the Bayview where even today, there's difficulty even maintaining internet connections. One way that that could be addressed is by pushing for a pilot program of free Wi Fi in Black communities. Because we are usually the ones that are either paying higher rates or we're being excuse me, or we're being trapped into very specific overpriced internet service plans that don't fully provide us the coverage that we need. This has repercussions in the types of work that we're allowed to do. This has repercussions in the access to information. And it is quite limiting for our children, some of which who are homeschooled and rely on internet access and stable Internet access in order to interact with their classmates and complete their work. Also, there was a clinic that was specifically for Black people in the Bayview it was actually created by Arthur Coleman, who was one of the first African American doctors and one of the first doctors period to have a private practice in San Francisco and specifically in the Bayview after his clinic was created when the say in about 1971. The Bayview foundation the bayview Hunters Point Foundation also provided similar services to African Americans in the Bayview so we had resources they were stripped away, and I I do want to emphatically bring services are brought back because we need to have services by us for us moving forward. And that is no slight to any of my coworkers in the healthcare field. But we need representation in all aspects of our identity of our life and our life, our lived experience. And that includes who cares for us and our most vulnerable times. Thank you.

15:33

Thank you. Are there any other Members of the public? I do see dot I saw Dr. Raymond Tompkins hand raised. And then I saw the hand go down. Dr. Tompkins, can you unmute yourself?

15:59

Thank you. Am I unmuted? Yes, thank you. Thank you, I want to first honored Dr. Amos Brown for taking the time to meet with me, I think to discuss some of the research that I conducted in Bayview Hunters Point on air pollution and increased susceptibility African Americans towards this pollution that is impacting the health quality. And I'm also a member of the southeast clinic's advisory board since 1994. And we are going before the mayor to ask for Black doctors, physicians, to practice medicine at the SE clinic. That is a serious issue that we have, that we do not have young men and women, African American men and women practicing in the predominant with our patient base is over 50% at the clinic, it is met, it's been established through research that a person of their own ethnicity have a more humanistic contact, they open up they have discussions with the doctor, and you get a complete picture of the disease of what the suffering of the patient is. And you don't have cultural barriers interfering with it. I also would like to discuss one other issue of scientific I used to run a hospital lab for two and a half years, then I got out of it. Now I do environmental science and medicine. But there is a disease that I am there was some discussion on the state and other people not understanding a direct lineage from slavery. And today, let me make very, very clear to you in my own family history. When writing the

history my uncle conveyed to me, he's passed on of the Frenchman visiting the slave quarters, and that the Frenchman left to gift to us, a genetic mutation of blood that my father died from is called factor five, where the blood coagulates. And this is only found in Europeans and not in Africans, my brother and myself suffer from this genetic mutation. And I went in for surgery. And I came very close to death behind it because of blood clots accumulating. African Americans have this disease, and this is direct lineage to for those of us that were in Louisiana, you understand my parents came from there, and terms of breeding of slaves by whites, when they couldn't important, it was cheaper to breed them. This is a direct lineage. And if anyone studies the history of the Bay Area, the Federal manpower is commissioned, recruited from Texas and Louisiana. And that's how you have these Ascendance to end you will see the prevalence of this disease throughout and it's not treated. And unfortunately, just like my father, African Americans die needlessly because of the lack of understanding of society.

19:29

Cheryl Thornton, can you unmute? Oh, okay.

19:32

Can you hear me? Hello? Yes. Okay. Hi. So, what I wanted to say is my family moved here in 1973, due to my dad had opportunity to attend UCSF dental school. And I guess at the time there were no Black practitioners pretty much in San Francisco. So, UCSF, I guess I'm trying to, I guess work on equity or something, they invited maybe 25 Black African American people to go to dental school. So, he worked in the southeast section of San Francisco. And until his death till 2010, but um, I work in the health department, and they've had, they haven't had a program like that since. So even in oral health, you don't have any dentists that pretty much look like us. But also, what I noticed working in the health department, the Black residents that they bring from Howard University that are doing their residency at the DPH. None of those residents are ever placed at SES health center, or Potrero Hill, Potrero Hill has been, you know, it's really been gentrified quite a bit because of the rebuild of the housing that's going on up there. But I think that that is a way that maybe they can get some Black doctors. And I think that somebody we could talk to somebody could talk to maybe UCSF, looking at that program that they did in 1973. They put a call out nationwide to bring people here that were qualified to go to dental school, and they were, and they were invited to go to that dental-to-dental school. So that's what I wanted to add. So, thank you.

21:33

Thank you. Well, LaDonna. LaDonna Williams.

21:43

Yes, good evening LaDonna Williams. Since the agenda was posted late, or we couldn't find it ahead of time, it's hard to know where to I went through the list, trying to figure out where my comment would be appropriate. But I wanted to get some clarity on the recommended amount. As I remember from the previous meeting, there was an amount in the draft that listed \$5 million. However, once the governor released or the news released the recommendations, that was I guess, supposed to be going to the governor, it's been reduced to 223,000. And less, I'm just not understanding the process. So, I'm hoping we'll get some clarity on those amounts tonight. And if in fact, it has been reduced from 5 million to 223,000, how it is and who it is that came up with those amounts. And so, I'm assuming looking at

the agenda, just briefly, that you guys will give us some clarity on what the actual recommended amounts will be. And the other thing being is the info, looking online when it says that we can reach out to you all as a committee, and I guess reaching out to you means we should be able to get some responses. You know, we've written the committee's trying to get clarity on particular items. And you know, trying to engage, because at this level here, when we're on these meetings with you guys, you'll say Hey, show up at the City Council or you know, contact us to be engaged yet you don't get a response back. And also, previous meetings that were listed, at least on my calendar that I got off your website, half the time, we'd go to the meeting at the scheduled time, and there was no meeting or no cancellation that came through. So I would just request as we move forward, that there'll be more effort made to communicate to the public so that we can engage so that we can engage with you all, you know, in an informed way, getting agendas at the very last minute and trying to skim through them to know you know where we can give comments or input on the spotlight that really does not make for a real effective communication or engagement. Thank you.

24:31

Thank you. Are there any other Members of the public who would like to participate on general public comment on items not on the agenda? Okay, Chair, I do not see any Members of the public indicating they would like to participate in public comment at this time.

24:52

Thank you Seeing none public comment is now closed. And thank you to all Members of the community who took the time to share your Comments in perspectives with us. We do appreciate it. Alright, so we will proceed now. Next item, please.

25:06

4. CHAIR REPORT *(Discussion Item)*

Presentation: Eric McDonnell, Chair, African American Reparations Advisory Committee, San Francisco Human Rights Commission

Tinisch Hollins, Vice Chair, African American Reparations Advisory Committee, San Francisco Human Rights Commission

Public Comment

Committee Discussion

Item number four is the chair report. This is a discussion item with the presentation from Eric McDonald chair, African American Reparations Advisory Committee, and Tinisch Hollins, Vice Chair, African American Reparations Advisory Committee, there will be public comment and committee comment, and committee discussion on this item.³²¹ Thank you so much. Again, we appreciate all of community that is able to join us, we appreciate you being with us couple of things, both for the committee, but perhaps maybe more broadly for community. And then I will call on Vice Chair Hollins. Well, I just want to underscore what one of the Members of community, Mr. Williams commented on, which is that there is an upcoming AB 3121 California reparation task force meeting coming up. It is on the 14th and 15th of December. So this week, on Wednesday and Thursday, it begins at nine a m each day it will be held at the Oakland City Hall. And so, I want to encourage all those that can and are interested certainly of committee and also community to participate in that meeting. Again, it starts at 9am, what I would

encourage was trying to find them now I'm not seeing the opportunity to post the link in the chat. So, if someone could only have hosted panelists, I don't see everyone in the so if someone could post that, that would be fantastic. So that everyone can see the agenda. They started nine and they don't listen in time because they don't have an in time they go until they work through their agenda, which includes opportunities both for hearing certainly, but also for discussion amongst the committee Members. So again, invite you to participate. And also, as you heard, Dr. Amos Brown is on that committee, so he will be present there as well. Second thing I just wanted to particularly because we are at this moment now of reviewing and subsequently submitting our interim report, when we began our work together kind of this journey, we talked about what would become important and we now I would observe at the moment, that there would be a need for an advocacy campaign, that in order to bring that pressure, quite frankly, advocacy pressure to the Members of the board of supervisors to support adoption, acceptance and action on the recommendations that we make that that would be necessary. So just one wanted to remind us of that. And, and also the importance, therefore of doing so with some intention. And so just a moment again, I'm going to call on Vice Chair Hollins. Offering my perspective appreciating the not only everyone holds the same. I believe that this advocacy campaign certainly should be led by us. Us as in Black leadership, and it should include, and I actually believe that we'll need to include other allies. And so just to name a few that have already at least named their intentions, and we certainly will hold them accountable should we decide to go down that path. But the Black and Jewish unity coalition, the horizons Unlimited, the Japanese community youth council, the Interfaith Council, the Bayview alliance of these just organizations that again have reached out to say they're interested, it's not that not many, many others, as potentially there are and will be as we go forward. So just want to invite us to hold that we will be scheduling meetings or resuming I should say meetings with the committee leads so that we can again bring some intentionality and coordination and strategic intention around said campaign. So more to come on that but wanted to lift that up. And with that, we'll turn it over to Vice Chair Hollins.

29:20

Thank you, Chairman McDonnell, good evening to all the Members of the advisory committee and Members of the public who have tuned in I'm going to keep this brief because I know we have a pretty robust agenda. But I wanted to report out to you all that December 1 through third, which was just last week, I had the privilege of attending the national the second national Reparations symposium held in Evanston, Illinois. This is in partnership with NAARC which is the National African American Reparations commission and first repair, which is the organization that has been leading Reparations work in Evanston, Illinois, one of the first in the country as a model for how No harm has been repaired in a in one of our local cities in this country. I'll give a brief report, I want to thank Director Davis, and Brittini Chicuata, who also joined me at the symposium and have been doing a lot of work to make sure that we maintain the connection and provide updates on what we're doing here in San Francisco. But just to give you all a little bit of a flavor of the intentionality behind the symposium, the goal of the symposium was to pull together other cities across the country that are leading Reparations efforts to learn how the work has been led by first repair in Evanston, Illinois, also to do a deeper dive into the history around Reparations and how it can be scaffolded is an opportunity to learn from each other. There were working sessions over two days where you had representation from Tulsa to Boston to Detroit, all across the country where folks were talking about different efforts and where they were in those efforts locally, to advance Reparations, and then, of course, nationally, an update on where

things are with HR 14. There is also a documentary called The Big Payback that should be featured on Netflix and other platforms soon if you haven't seen it. But there was a screening of the big pay back while we were out there, Evanston Township High School was attended by Erika Alexander, who was a famous Black actress, many of you know, from Living Single, who's also been a stakeholder in this moment for a while. The highlight of this convening was on December 2 in the evening, US Congresswoman Sheila Jackson Lee, who was the lead sponsor of HR 40, came to Evanston to meet with us, and to demand that President Biden move forward through executive order. The process of establishing a commission, a national Reparations commission, to continue the work of exploring what national Reparations could look like HR 40, there were a few big takeaways that I want to share with the group and some of it is complimentary to what chair McDonald share with you all. One is, I'm not sure that many of you all knew I wasn't aware until I went out there. That in California, we have several initiatives underway in different cities, exploring what Reparations could look like San Francisco, of course, is one of them. Also Palm Springs. And I believe there's Palm Springs, there, San Francisco, Sacramento is also working on an initiative. And then of course, the work that's being done at state level by Dr. Brown and the rest of the folks on the commission. We are working to check in and be more aligned and learn from each other exactly what's happening in those cities, and also how that complements what's happening at state level. We have a call to check in later this week. And we'll be talking about more formal ways for us to continue engaging with those other cities as we move forward. The fourth city Thank you, Dr. Taylor is Berkeley, Berkeley is also looking into this. So getting more alignment with them. The other thing that I thought was really important to know is that nationally there was a lot of support and interest in the work that we're doing here in San Francisco. While we know the dream Keeper Initiative is not a replacement for Reparations, and that there's restrictions on what we can do with the dream Keeper initiative in terms of earmarking dollars, specifically for the Black community, and it is not redress or repair for harm. But it is a way to show what it looks like when we we do direct investments into Black programs, organizations, entrepreneurship, giving direct cash to Black people, through universal basic income and all the other different ways that we've been able to scale up the Black community through dream keepers received a lot of great praise. But the reality and we all know is that we're very limited until we deal with the legality, the legal issues that restrict us from being able to earmark dollars specifically as Black dollars for African American community and tiptoeing around the legal restrictions that we have, because things like prop 209 did not pass. And so kind of moving toward what chair McDonald said, our advocacy. We all know that advocacy was necessary, though we're at a moment now. And we've heard it from Members of the public, whether the Members of the public are aware or not, because they're not in all of our conversations. It's a frustration that we share to all of this work is important and critical and necessary. But one if we're leading the way in the state, and we're leading the way as a state that we cannot back down from a direct conversation about what it means to say Black Americans specific Black San Francisco specific and make sure that those dollars are earmarked to do that and that we find every legal precedent to make sure that that happens. So that we are not having to deal with the What about Autism, we're splitting our resources, amongst other communities because there is a restriction or a sanction around, being able to do that. There is a lot more conversation that needs to happen around this. But what we also learned is that building that relationship and Ally ship with the folks who say, and organizations who say that they are in support of Reparations or wants to continue to build that conversation in their communities, is also critical. So a lot of the organizations that share McDonald name are important. If there are others Member of this committee, Members of this committee and Members of the public want to raise as folks to join in on

this effort, there will be plenty of time for that conversation. But the time is now the time is now for us to address that concern, especially going into 2023. If we want to see any legs, not only to the recommendations that are coming out of the record, the Reparations, advisory committees report through San Francisco, but for the immediate needs of Blacks, San Francisco has right now, advocacy, and organizing is critical. So I want to thank you all for taking the moment to hear that report. I also want to thank Director Davis, Brittini and all the staff that HRC for the support that they provide to the committee. And with that, I will hand it back over to Chairman go.

36:15

Members of the public who would like to comment on anything that was discussed during the chairs report, please use your race and i con to indicate you would like to comment. Public comment will be three minutes. I see Dr. Tompkins Welcome back, Dr. Tompkins.

36:15

Thank you so much Vice Chair Hollins. And so as I said, more to come in terms of the organizing efforts that we believe will be required, frankly, necessary, certainly, to move this work forward. And so let's go to public comment and then we will return to any committee discussion around this.

36:57

I apologize. I didn't realize my hand was up. But I do support the effort in moving forward for Reparations 100%. And I make one quick modification on my request for physicians at the southeast clinic that they understand environmental medicine, just because you Black and you don't understand the conditions of what kill are killing people with the high asthma, pulmonary, cardiovascular and breast cancer which is affected for my Members of my family. It's imperative that they understand this just because you Black you must have an understanding of the disease and the cause of these high adverse health effects. Thank you so very much.

37:47

Thank you, Dr. Tompkins. Now I'd like to welcome Alyssa Jones Garner.

37:57

Thank you. I have three questions. I will try to make them as brief as possible. Has any additional legal research being conducted or included in the report? And I apologize if it has, I'm just seeing the report this evening. Because there is case law and legal precedents for establishing Reparations going back to the 1700s in this country. So and also, dad wanted to approach one of the questions that I believe was brought up by a community Member Phyllis that regarding the amount of the payment, because there is established, there are previous Reparations laws and acts that have established payment amounts for specific groups that may have contributed to the amount or the lowering of the amount that was previously stated. One thing that I hope can be incorporated is the following language. Reparations shall be paid on a continuous basis, so long as the qualifying harm exists and continues to negatively impact the applicant. I think that will address some concerns that may come up later. In regards of receiving a one-time lump sum for systematic issues that are still impacting our community, our community and that had not adequately been addressed or redressed previously, and it would provide

a financial incentive for the city and county to be more progressive in addressing systematic racism and abuse throughout every single department and institution in San Francisco. Thank you.

39:51

Thank you. Jeffrey Greer, welcome to this evening's meaning Okay, can you hear me

40:00

Yes, thank you, pretty much. I'd like to go what she said. And endorse that. But also throw another on this, this has been decades, generations centuries long. So whatever, we should be getting a lump sum and a continuous payment to make it right. That's what I was trying to get to. That's something that should be looked at and examined. And we need just by the amount of public comment we've had, in a short time we've been on this meeting, mental health is a primary concern. Physical is a primary, all of the items are holes in our ability to exist. Whereas if things are left, as it is quite clear that we are headed for sure, extinction. Regarding the amount of payment and what the size is, you can be sure that there's movement behind the scenes on this redefinition of what is Black. Believe me, they didn't have a problem. For centuries defining who was Black, all of a sudden, we've got a problem. The same issue occurred when they gave the Indians their money, or Native Americans, excuse me, gave them their money, and especially down in Florida, and seminars, you know, they all of a sudden we're going to receive land and, and the other people decided that they should redefine who was a Native American, and Native Americans have their own process. So be very careful when we start getting around that bad, bad area of who's, who's Black? Who's the definition? Who's defining. Thank you.

41:59

Thank you. And I just go ahead. Go ahead, please. I just want to remind public commenters that you are commenting on the report from the chair and vice chair and the contents of that report. Now, I would like to welcome with LaDonna Williams, welcome.

42:21

Thank you again, one of the folks on the committee. I can't remember her name. Once again, mentioned the legalities, I guess the legal issues around prop 209, which we hear quite often. And I just wonder within this report, have you adequately looked into the fact that San Francisco put together 118 million plus dollars in counting specific language is San Francisco, Asian and Pacific Islanders who this money is targeted and earmarked for? There has been no mention in that about Prop 209 about the legalities and preventing this population or group from getting redress or as they're calling it Reparations, which I don't think it is. I think they are one of those fabricated minorities who have been able to ride off the backs of Black Americans issues. Yet, they have no problem sliding through getting this support and getting this money. That wasn't for everything else to be included in there. It was money. They didn't mention education. They didn't mention all this other stuff. They recognized the need to give them some money for this elevated harm that we've been seeing that is televised more. But when you peel back the layers and you look at the FBI reports and what have you, you see that they have the lowest incidences of harm being done to them compared to what has happened to Black folks over the last 400 years. So you know, it's just really disappointing to see all of this talk back and forth, up and down with the amounts that we cannot stop and say wait a minute common sense for 100 plus years and counting because our harm has not stopped. But even within that timeframe that you all

are putting in the report. We still have this problem stating the amount of money that we know it really is no amount that can make up for it. But at least start with a realistic amount of \$5 million per person is not farfetched when you compare it to the \$450,000 that they were proposing for the Latinos for two years of harm, and the amount of money that they are given to the Asians come on committee, and I feel you advocacy, we're there. We're gonna do our

45:24

45:28

Thank you. Now I'd like to welcome Cynthia Murray. And I just want to remind everyone that there is an item number coming up that is discussion about the report. So if you can make your comments or veer your comments towards what the chair and vice chair reported out, that would be much appreciated. Welcome, Cynthia.

45:55

Thank you, I'm trying to stay on point I'm having difficulty following the agenda to make sure that my comments are in the appropriate place. But I heard us talking about cash payouts and what that might look like. And I'm suggesting that not only that there'll be a cash payout, but there also should be a pocket of assistance available for education, college tuition, down payments on homes, definitely mental health services, and free childcare and possibly financial management assistance. I conclude. Thank you very much.

46:37

Thank you. Are there any other Members of the public would like to comment on the report from the chair and vice chair? I see Virginia Marshall. Welcome.

46:54

Oh, thank you so much, Miss, Madam Chair and committee. I agree with everything that the previous speakers have said before me, if we could have all these things for the community, the project would be just as wonderful, especially helping our young people and anyone in our community who wants to go home, help them with a credit repair, help our students get out, get out of the verge of college debt, although and of course, a mental health and wellness, all those things that everyone has said I completely agree and to have help our young people with a college education. And everyone I don't believe needs a want to have a college education, but they must be prepared to go to work. So of investing with our community with the trade of the union's when a hotshot finishes high school, he or she should have a skill that they can earn a living with, and college, it just reinforces what they're what they've already learned and what that what that might want to learn. So I think the committee, I look forward to having all these things implemented, hopefully, in my lifetime. Thank you so much.

48:06

Thank you, Miss Marshall. Now, I would like to announce, you know, is there any Members of the public who would like to participate in public comment on the chair and the vice chairs report? Okay, chair,

McDonald and Vice Chair Hollins, I do not see any Members of the public who would like to comment on this item. Thank you so much. And public comment is now closed.

48:33

Excuse me, as we transition to our next item, a couple of things. One, just want to make the clear distinction between the work of this committee and the California State Task Force. And the discussions around amounts being made available or invested in and towards families. The numbers that were referenced on public comment are not numbers coming from this committee. So just want to make that that distinction in item six, when we come to it, which is the draft of our Reparations plan that is to be submitted to the, to the Board of Supervisors and to the Human Rights Commission. You will see what we are representing in way of all of the recommendations and so that link was put in the chat. If you don't have it, please take a look at it. And then you can at least hold what we're initially representing in this draft. There will be continued work posted draft because we have a final report that will be submitted to the board of super sorry, Board of Supervisors and Human Rights Commission and the mayor's office in June of next year. So we have a window of opportunity in time to continue to tighten, refine, enhance, expand etc. And that that's our window. Member Berry Your hand is raised because it was supposed to be Member discussion after the chair report and public comment. Okay, so hold on one hold on one second, one of the things they do, and I'll come right back to you. And so we have that opportunity. Other thing I just wanted to, again establish is that as the recommended recommendations are being tightened and refined and reviewed and then subsequently submitted, that we have not discussed, not asking for something because of prop 209. What we've said is, we want to recognize the potential impediment that prop 209 may represent. But we've not said, Because of 209, we want to ask for certain things. So just want to make again clear that distinction that when we make references to one nine, we're not doing so to suggest, therefore, we're not going to make some request or demand to the city. With that. Thank you, Member berry for your patience, please. And then Rev.Brown.

50:59

Thank you, Chair. I just wanted to one thank the public for their comments and to add to your list of allies that support Reparations that you yourself and Vice Chair Hollins did a great presentation at the San Francisco Bernie Kratz. And they held a vote and they voted to YES to support us and our report. That is all. Thanks so much. Appreciate that. Thanks for that reminder. Rev.Brown, please. You're muted, sir. You're still muted, unfortunately. All right. Success. Now.Good evening, everybody. You're looking good there. Mr. Chair, Members of our task force Advisory Committee. Two things I want to mention number one, to come in the stands. Doing diligence to pull together the substantive eliminate report, remember, forgive me sir, can I just ask a question? Are you going to speak to kind of the report and any thoughts you have about that? Or are you going to speak about the report? Right, so we're not on that item just yet. Item six is going to be on the report. Well i thought you called for comments on the item or on which is item number four, which was the chairs report. So the report I made and the report that Vice Chair Hobbins made around the work they did her trip to Evanston for the summit. Item six is going to be on the on the report. And that'll be the great space for you to share your thoughts about the report. Okay, very well, we'll wait until then. Thank you, sir. Member Brown?

53:12

Yes, um, in regards to the report, one of the things that I think everyone is familiar with in California is Allensworth that is now a State Historic Park. I think it might be worth the body to look at the fact that the State Park was named as was made a state park as a result of what that was a Black town that was cut off. By that county, the water was cut off that was a farming town. So that was intentional. So as my I'm pretty sure they made a state park to acknowledge that harm. I do not know if there was Reparations attached to that acknowledgement by making it a state park. So in the conversation about the state case, possibly since they're already admitting or acknowledging that there was some that there was some impediment made by those policies of that city and county, that that led to the deterioration of that that city that was a thriving farming city. That might be something a strategy that we may need to look at or address. When we're thinking about how to create the conversation about what we're doing throughout California and in Barstow, San Francisco. Since it seems like an easy win since they already saying they messed up.

54:37

Thank you remember Brown, Members of committee any other comments about the chairs and vice chairs report? We're gonna get to the report. momentarily. I know we are all eager to get there. , just report Excellent. Thank you. Alrighty, seeing or hearing none, we will close this. I, my apologies, my apologies. Just saw your hand, please.

55:12

Um, so about the social advocacy like about Reparations in San Francisco, we should go over about like, Hold on one second. Rev Brown, can you mute yourself, like stretching to the younger audience like people my age all the way up to like, well, 25 and younger, because like a lot of people do not know about Reparations in San Francisco, like I was just talking about, about Reparations, the last meeting with my roommate, that she lives, she lives in San Francisco, but she had never heard of it. So like, I feel like we should do like more like Instagram ads, because like, based on the area you're in, you can see ads about whatever's happening. But also tick tock because like, based on the algorithm, like, based on like, where people are at, you can reach the audience or if you're like interested into that, that you can see videos about that.

56:06

Thank you so much for lifting that up. Member Williams appreciate always your voice and perspective around engaging young people. And therefore we're going to circle back to you when it's time for the campaign itself and both pick your brain and seek to leverage your leadership. So more to come on that. Anyone else before we move? Seeing none, we will close this item. Let's please now go to item number five. And Secretary Meyer. After you introduce it please come back to me before we call them speakers.

56:38

5. 2023 FORWARD CALENDAR REVIEW (*Discussion Item*)

The African American Reparations Advisory Committee will review meeting dates from January 1, 2023 through June 30, 2023 and important 2023-2024 budget process information and dates.

Presentation: **Brittni Chicuata**, Director, Economic Justice Division, San Francisco Human Rights Commission

Radhika Mehlotra, Senior Fiscal and Policy Analyst, Mayor's Budget Office, City and County of San Francisco.

Public Comment

Committee Comment

Yes. 2023 is a forward calendar review. This is a discussion item. The African American Reparations Advisory Committee will review meeting dates between January 1 2023 Through June 30 2023 and important 2023 2024 budget processes information and dates. There will be a presentation from Brittni Chicuata, Director of the Economic Rights Division San Francisco Human Rights Commission, read the Kim Electra, senior fiscal policy analysts Mayor's budget office city and county of San Francisco. There will be public comment and committee comment on this item. And of course, now we will go back to chair McDonald. Thank you, Chair MacDonald.

57:25

Thank you so much. Just want to offer some context for this and the following item. And so I'm going to hand the floor over to Director Dr. Davis.

57:36

Thank you, Chair McDonnell. And thank you to the committee for their service in the work and to the folks joining us on the Zoom, just wanted to as you prepare to have the conversation around the calendar. I know the calendar, you're specifically looking at dates and events for January and connecting those with the budget. But just also wanted to acknowledge and recognize that we were late getting the draft Reparations plan out to folks today and want to be really mindful. So as you are planning and having this conversation, there are two things that I wanted to offer up through the Chair. First and foremost is the ability to extend time for the committee as well as the public. We've heard from folks here as well, to give feedback on this draft plan. We were initially planning to submit on Friday, but given that many of you did not receive it until today, there was a glitch with getting it out. We thought it had gone out last week. And unfortunately, it did not. So the first request or suggestion is that the committee have until next Monday, as well as community to give feedback on that which then would give us till next Friday, the second suggestion or request to turn in said, draft, what can happen through that process as committee Members can to avoid violation of quorum. Committee Members can email the HRC staff, we can then review that with the chair and vice chair and then prepare that to submit to you all to be able to go out so that we can get it out without having to call another meeting but that we can take your feedback and then have a conversation with the chair and vice chair in isolation and separate so that it's not a quasi meeting. So that's just my main thing is just wanted to acknowledge and recognize that we were able to get the draft plan out to people ahead of time and that we wanted to provide space so that you did not feel if you so desire. Feel free tonight if you want to. But just to offer that up to folks who may feel like they need a little bit more time to digest and review. So that was my main thing. So as you're talking about the calendar as you're making plans is to offer up until Monday for feedback and next Friday the 23rd to actually submit to the board and relevant parties.

1:00:04

Thank you, Director, Dr. Davis. Appreciate that context and acknowledgement of again, just where we are in the overall process. Member Erving, I see your hand we are scheduled to have a presentation first, can your comments wait until we have the presentation?

1:00:23

Sure, it was about Dr. Davis's suggestion about email, you want me to still wait? Go ahead. I'm just curious if there's any alternatives or a different way to communicate for the Members of the public other than email, I think about people who have accessibility issues, and just curious if there's like a call line or something else.

1:00:46

Yeah, I mean, I definitely can offer up this is what I would say to folks. So you know, I know the next couple of weeks may be challenging and difficult for folks. But first and foremost, I want to make sure that people have the right email address. And but I'm troubled to hear that folks have been emailing and not getting a response. So want to make sure that we are on top of that, and that that does not continue to happen. Second, I would say and this is something that I can work out with Angelique Mahan but in general folks can call 252415, area code 415252 2500. And, and just when you call say, we are, I'm calling to leave comments about the Reparations plan. And the way that the city system works is that we actually get that as a voicemail through our email. So if you call and leave that message, we actually can copy and take it from that as well. So folks can call that number. And if somebody answers, just say, hey, I want to leave a message. And you can either leave it with the person, or they can let you call back and go directly to the voicemail to do that. But we want to make sure to share the Reparations, email address, and then the phone number folks can use that. And then if folks are so inclined, I don't know that we'd be able to do it for next week. But I think that we are open to we've got interns and other folks that can help if somebody just wants somebody to sit and listen and take notes, we can, we can try and work that out as well. But I would say the best bet is email and phone number. Thank you again, Director Davis. So with that, we're going to go to the presentation. So I will turn it over to Director Chicuata

1:02:31

Thank you, I'd actually like to invite Radhika Mehlotra to present first and then I can go over the overarching timeline for 2023. Radhika Mehlotra good Awesome.

1:02:47

Hi, everybody. Thanks very much for having me. I am Radhika. I'm a senior Member of the Mayor's budget office. And I wanted to talk a bit about process of the budget process today. And I sent over a presentation hoping we can bring that up. Awesome. So I put together this presentation. So it can serve as a resource that folks can kind of come back to. So I won't review all of the slides. But there's in the beginning, some helpful sort of context set setting slides. And then towards the end, there's some good information about what was actually included in the budget last year, and also some high level information about sort of how the budget outlook is looking for the next couple of years. So if for now we could please jump to slide eight. The title of that slide is factors that shape the city budget. Awesome. So I wanted to go ahead and first start by laying out the three very major factors that actually shape the city budget. And you know, a lot of this is pretty obvious to all of us. But I really wanted to actually name this. And so the first and primary driver is how much money is actually available for us to spend. And some really big inputs that are part of this question include, you know, how is the economy doing? Are we at our all of the revenues that we're kind of counting on to create the kind of programs

and to upkeep the kind of programs that we want to is that is that amount of revenue actually going to come in, within the city? What are the cost pressures? I'm thinking about ongoing ever growing cost of labor and other expenses. So kind of just really thinking about what resources are actually available for us to spend. The second of course, is who's in charge? And what are their priorities. So of course, the mayor, the Board of Supervisors, and everybody has a policy agenda that they're following. Everybody has priorities that are following. But in addition to that, there's sort of a lot of information, gathering and sharing that's constantly happening, right? So given a list of priorities, we're constantly thinking about what's a new, better, more efficient way of approaching the problem. And so that's kind of constantly being informed in that way. And last is, of course, what are the state? What's happening at the state and federal level? So what's happening DC, what's happening in Sacramento? What are the new policies and programs that are being implemented? What is the impact of that in the local context here in San Francisco? How much are things going to cost? Where is that money going to come from? So this is just a sort of really high level view into all of the things and you know, for the for the most part, all of these factors are being considered at the same time when we're thinking about how to approach the city budget. Next slide, please. And so I wanted to jump right into sort of the timeline of this whole process. And since that's, I think, most crucial to everybody that's gathered here. And so the city is sort of always in what we call budget season. But for us, the bottom line is that the mayor must introduced a balanced to your budget on June 1 of each year. And so given that timeline, and given that that's sort of the bottom line for us, I wanted to hone in a little bit about on the community input process and how that's already sort of baked into this, you know, many months long budget season. So in in this in this slide, I've noted that basically starting right about now, in the year, two, you know, early spring, is when, especially for the mayor's proposed budget, because just to sit back for one second, there's the mayor's proposed budget that comes out on June wine, and then there's the board approved budget that comes out later on this summer in August. And so if we're really thinking about targeting the mayor's proposed budget, this is sort of the window to do that in during this window. We this is the time that we're spending assessing proposals, both from city departments as well as from community groups and other Member organizations. We're basically hearing all of the proposals that they would like to be heard, we're trying to figure out how those proposals align with the mayor's priorities, and then sort of starting the decision making during this time. So if we go to the next slide, please. I wanted to mention that there are even within that window and sort of moving beyond, there are these touch points that are baked into the process that are really meant for the community to weigh in for the community to be a part of this process. The first of that is a departmental touch point. That That means that departments and this is a charter mandate in the city departments hold public meetings to solicit feedback on budget priorities, and their own departmental proposed budgets. In January and February, most departments are charter mandated to have two public meetings. So that's your first touch point that's happening with departments. The second touch point and less sort of official and that it's not charter mandated. But staff from across the mayor's office meet with community groups in roughly the spring time in March. So whether it's people from my office, which is the mayor's budget office, whether it's the policy staff, we're constantly communicating with community groups, advocacy groups, really trying to understand what the need in the community is, and then simultaneously sort of thinking about how those needs are aligning with the policy priorities, and sort of kicking off that decision making with the mayor. The last touch point, which of course is not part of the mayor's proposed budget process, but is a touch point is the board and that happens much later on after June. But the Board of Supervisors staff also has a lot of interaction with community groups and tries to really kind of iterate on that same process. So that

that need can then be accommodated into the board phase of the budget process. Next slide, please. So, basically, just to step back and give you all a sense here, roughly between now and you know end of February, early March, department and sort of developing their budget proposals. And once once we have the department proposals, that's when March through June, we call that Mayor phase. That's when our office is examining all the proposals, just as I mentioned, both from departments and from community groups as aligning on mural priorities. And then in June through July, the board is doing that same exercise. Next slide, please. So I wanted to this is a bit of a timeline that, please everybody feel free to review this. And I'm really happy to answer any follow up questions that might come up. But I wanted to highlight a couple of milestones here that are really key for our budget decision making for future years. So right now we're in fiscal year 2223. All the dates that I'm about to highlight are really going to inform fiscal year 24, and fiscal year 25 decisions. And so in December, just later this week, actually, on Thursday and Friday, the mayor is going to issue her budget instructions. This is guidance on her mayoral priorities, as well as sort of potential any potential cuts, given the economic picture of San Francisco moving into the next two, and then the three years after that. So this is a five year picture. In January, the mayor's office along with the controller's office, and the budget, and legislative analyst, which is basically the budget office for the board of supervisors, we issue what will be called the five year financial report that will include all of this information. So that will really detail out that based on the projected revenues over the next five years, if we don't make any policy decisions, if we don't change anything, what is the delta? What's the difference between where our revenues might come in, and how much our spending is growing? So that's what this report is going to lay out is what's the difference in sort of money coming in, and what are all of the expenses that the city has sort of already has already committed to. Then in later February, as I showed on the previous slide, departments will submit their budgets for the next two fiscal years. So that's fiscal year 24. And fiscal year 25, which then kicks off Mayor phase, then in mid March, and this five year report that I just mentioned, that will be issued in January, in mid March, we will actually issue an update to that report. So given that we've demonstrated this sort of projected five year picture in January, two months later, we say these are the honed in projections. And here's here's sort of like an update to what those projections look like. And then lastly, in June, one on June, one is when the mayor's budget for all of the general fund departments comes out. So those are the kinds of important dates to consider, as you sort of digest this information. Next slide, please. And just wanted to offer that it's all linked here. So if you go into the clickable version of this presentation, you'll be able to access all of this, all of the reports that I've mentioned, for the for the last two fiscal years. And so just wanted to offer that as a resource. We can start presenting here, there's a lot more slides a lot more information for people if they wanted to get familiar. But that's the sort of like timeline process part of the presentation. Thank you Radhika. And I just wanted to one step back and give some additional context to that presentation. Because this was in response to the A Rex multiple requests for information on budget advocacy for the committee. So just as a reminder, you know, this was not a funded committee, there was no budget that was allocated with the creation of the African American Reparations Advisory Committee. And so the Human Rights Commission has been underwriting the word but that means that we've been pulling money from other things that were funded in our budget process. And so while I know that we're grateful that director Davis made those decisions, at the end of the day, it still takes money away from other things that were budgeted. And so we want and believe that this committee deserves to have its own allocation of dollars and Members have asked for allocation of dollars to do different things. And so we invited Rebecca because as she mentioned, the budget instructions from the mayor just came out

this month, and we don't want to be behind the ball in any way on advocating to the mayor. And then if need be to the Board of Supervisors For budget funding for this committee. And so I know, Chair McDonald that will go to questions after but if my colleague John could bring up the other slides that I have just to go over the overarching 2020 340 No, not this one. The other slides are about the forward calendar. And that one should be called a wreck timeline 2023 2022 and 2023. Brittni Thank you. I'm looking for the slides that you're calling forward.

1:15:46

No problem. I can also share if you don't have that one handy.

1:15:56

If you have available, that would probably be the most expeditious way. Thanks, Cathy, you can go to the next slide. Okay, so our goals for 2023. As you all know, seat 15 remains vacant. And we have been publicizing for this seat. The one stipulation for this for C 15 is that you must currently or have previously lived in public housing. And so that application is open. We've gotten a few inquiries, but no one has applied yet or the clerk of the board has not advised that anyone has yet applied. So please continue circulating that opportunity. And we hope that in January, we'll be able to schedule a meeting with the Rules Committee to move applicants forward. We'd also like to have some more public engagements now that there are more opportunities to meet in person. And so one idea we have is around having some mixers and public spaces across the city. And just to the point of accessibility, making sure that we're meeting people where they are. And we know that when we have those in person engagements, it just brings a different energy. So I want to thank Anjeanette Coats, and Metyia Phillips, who reached out to each of the Members of the committee and conducted interviews just to take a temperature check and also go over any additions that you might have for the sample, the draft, Reparations plan, report, and also get your feedback on cohosting mixers. So we'll definitely to start blank be doing more with regard to our public engagement and outreach. We also have a survey that's been circulating for a while, we want to remind folks to please take the survey and also share it with your friends, with your family, with your loved ones with your colleagues, we want to get as much feedback as possible. And additionally, we have a specialized San Francisco Black census link. And we want to participate in that because in the spring, we'll be doing some work with the Black census project that's led by Alicia Garza and just want to make sure that we have as great participation as possible. We will we have we have submitted an application to do a bus campaign and MCA campaign on the inside of buses and bus depots for the Reparations committee, and that is also just to increase public engagement and make sure that all of the diverse communities across Black San Francisco are participating in this Reparations feedback process. So as chairman McDonald mentioned, we're going to be getting as much public feedback on the draft plan as possible. And we just want to make sure that we have diverse voices across our communities that are participating. Next, we're going to be moving forward with a Spatial Mapping Project with Kirby Lynch. And there'll be more information on that, but it'll really be an opportunity to to visualize the harm that we discuss across the report. So we'll be scheduling time for Kirby to meet with each of the committee Members as well as to present here to the full body in the spring. We are initiating a project with or not a project we are initiating a collaboration with USF and I want to thank Professor Taylor for his facilitation of this. So we'll be working with Professor Taylor and Professor Stephanie Sears who manages youth at the Marshall Riley live learn Housing Center, which is a community of Black students at USF and they will be supporting those

We're hosting a series of listening sessions at USF around Reparations as well as circulation of our survey. And then again, two stars playing, they'll be getting an assignment around social media where each, each team Member will have to produce things on Tiktok and Instagram to just increase engagement, particularly among the younger demographic. And then we will additionally be initiating a project with Dr. Rachel Berlinski, around qualitative research with her master's students to support completion of the work that we're doing in this committee. Next slide. Sorry, I'm trying to hit the next slide. Hold on, no problem. There. Thank you. So here are the dates for our future meetings in 2023. We will continue this conversation around budget advocacy and outreach in January as well as began discussions around the mapping project. We will be talking about public engagement and listening sessions. In February, and March, we don't have a headline topic, but that just wanted to highlight that that would be the deadline for us to hold a hearing at the board of supervisors to get any feedback, good, bad or otherwise to the draft Reparations plan. In April, we'll have our final presentation of the Spatial Mapping Project. In May, we'll discuss the draft final recommendations, and then that will be voted on and submitted in June. Next slide. So just wanted to give a reminder of the email address for those who are able to submit any comments or questions to SF Reparations at SF gov.org. Thank you, I give it back to the Chair.

1:22:05

Thank you so much appreciate both reports. redecker, as well as director to quieter, again, gives us context for the path forward, really appreciate it. Again, one underscore one thing before we go to public comment and then return back to committee for questions and other discussion related to this, that the budget and the budget resources that we're talking about are to support the work of the committee. These are not resources for Reparations, so just want to make that distinction. So the folks understand and appreciate what we are discussing, discussing, excuse me, and focused on in this moment and context. Um, so with that, let's go to public comment. And then we'll we'll return to committee discussion.

1:22:53

First, I do see Larry Martin's hand raised. Welcome, Larry. Thank you.

1:23:01

Yes. Good evening, everyone. I just have a question for Britney. Britney, I applied for the seat 15. And my question is, is my application still on file? Or do I need to file again, and get another letter a letter of recommendation? Because I reMember, I wasn't chosen at that time. When when Walton made that decision? So um, yeah, that's that's what do I what do I need to do I need to apply again, or is my application still on file? So I guess that's my question. Thank you, we

1:23:46

would ask that you resubmit your application, please.

1:23:48

Resubmit again. Okay. All right. Thank you.

1:23:55

Thank you. Now, I'd like to welcome Dr. Tompkins.

1:24:03

I'm sorry, that's my technical error.

1:24:06

Okay, thank you. Are there any Members of the IDC, another hand raise? Elissa Jones? Garner?

1:24:16

Yes, thank you. And I just want to first thank committee Member Brittnei, for your portion of the presentation. And you made a statement that I don't think people really appreciate it, and that is that the mayor did not fund this committee. And it has been my understanding that you put your money into what you value. The fact that this committee to this day still remains unfunded and this work is being done through the volunteer efforts of the committee Members is commendable, but it should be compensated. I just wanted to state that first. Second, from the presentation that was given about the budget. First, what are the mayor's budget instructions currently, to the departments, and has she soffit to include the mandate that the departments themselves take on some of this work as far as how they can make the work that they do the services that they provide more, not even just beneficial, but more equitable for our Black citizens in San Francisco. That it could be one step in helping the Reparations process on an institutional level. Second, and I apologize, I am ill and attempting to be as concise as possible. In regards to the budgeting process, it was stated that largely many of the decisions would be made would affect the 2824 budget. That budget cycle includes bargaining for every Labor Union in the city. So that means that we'd be fighting for Reparations at the time that many of our brothers and sisters 12% of the employed, the population employed by the city and county of San Francisco are also fighting for their own Reparations as sort in in the form of fair wages. And how is that going to contribute or decrease from the efforts of Reparations as a whole for San Francisco, if we will find ourselves embroiled in a battle with ourselves as both Black people living in San Francisco and harmed by San Francisco, but also working for the city and county of San Francisco? Thank you.

1:27:02

Thank you. Now I'd like to welcome LaDonna Williams.

1:27:09

Yes, thank you, Alisa, you, you hit it on the head? I was just going to come in and speak on that very thing. The mayor not funding that. What is that the Human Rights Commission to work on? This issue shows the ultimate disrespect for this process for making right the wrongs that has been done to Black folks. In this process. I wanted to ask and I apologize for mispronouncing your name. I was trying to spell it out as I heard it, but is it how erotica, who is the mayor's budget assistant? I guess, on this budget advocacy? Did you require the Asian population. And those committees that came before you when they had to come up with the Reparations and the amounts for those folks, where they asked to sit and analyze and understand the budget, the mayor's budget and the timeline and, and all of these things that are being thrown in our laps now to basically say, Okay, there's money earmarked for this. And this you guys hurry up, get in and advocate for this. From what I recall. And it was on every news channel, and every few seconds it was being ran when they were campaigning on the anti Asian hate.

San Francisco made it a priority. Former Willie Brown and everybody else showed up for this support for them. Where is the priority? And I'm hoping that you take this back to Mayor Breed that where's the priority? And you can show us through funding rather than tell us and so far what we're seeing here is more of the same. I don't see any difference between her reaction when we say Black folks or do this reparation, since she well knows that as well. But it's the same reaction we've been getting from the White House with Biden, and Harris, it's disrespectful. We no longer will tolerate this. Black folks continue to jump through hoops. It's bad enough that we keep having these meetings after meetings, these debt BS schedules that just delay a process. We can't get anything done on time. Everything keeps being pushed back. In the meantime, every other population, with their limited time of suffering has gotten have jumped frog leaps ahead of Black folks in getting support for their harm and their suffering. I ask that you take it to the mayor, do it now.

1:30:15

Thank you. Now I'd like to welcome Dennis Bishop. Can you unmute Dennis? Yeah, I'm I'm needed. Thank you.

1:30:26

So my first question is about the budget process and the forecasting. And how often the forecast the five year forecast, the young lady spoke about tracks toward? Well, how accurate is it? I guess, is my question. And my other comment. And so my comment following the previous to him, ladies is given historical patterns, this is not a surprise. If power concedes nothing without a demand. And if we actually really want this thing to go through, we have to be more organized, be more unified. And, and demanded at a level that hasn't been demanded before? Because if we don't, we'll keep running up against the same walls. Right. And it's just this is just historical patterns. It happens over and over and over again. And that's it. That's all I have to say.

1:31:46

Thank you. Are there any other Members of the public? Dr. Tompkins Your hand is raised up. And now I see. Member of the public McNeely. Welcome. This evening. Hello,

1:32:05

everyone. Don't think think everyone in the committee. I, I just wanted to say that. I also am very concerned that the Members of the Reparations committee are not being paid for their efforts. I think that's such a red flag. And the reason why is because free labor is what got us here in the first place, right? And enslavement of our people. And subsequent discrimination have got us here in the first place. So I'm like very, like disheartened that not only are they not being paid, but just like what is the thought process going on here? That and then I will also say to I think I believe her name is Radhika I don't want to I'm sorry if I pronounced it incorrectly, that I would like to see, as I'm sure other people in public would like to see. Um, you know, when Reparations is passed in San Francisco, like, what what is that going to look like on the city budget level? What is that going to look like? That's very important for us to know. Because I am unsure if you know, everybody knows this. And people that are listening that all eyes are on San Francisco, this is a historic moment. San Francisco is being looked at as one of the biggest and first major cities to have a Reparations committee and there are others that are following suit. So with that being said, Sure, there are going to be mistakes that are happening. But we

need to be mindful of the fact that like, all eyes are on us. And it's very important that the processes and how it's done is is kind of like very thorough, and, and well thought out on the budgeting level. I would like to also say that, you know, I really, I again, feel bad for the committee. I thought they were being paid for their work. That's just really, really bad and bad taste. So thank you again, committee for your work. I'm going to say it a million times. Thank you again for your free labor. It's not okay. Not okay with that. And now that's all I have to say. Thank you.

1:34:34

Thank you Now I'd like to welcome the Seligman Thank you.

1:34:43

Have a question I know you don't respond to in public comment, but let me raise the question and possibly at a later point he shouldn't because it's not clear to me how, in June of 2023, either the committee chair request

1:35:19

just me or she cut off?

1:35:21

I do not hear her chair. Okay.

1:35:24

Mr. Luckman, your connection has been lost, so we can't hear you.

1:35:31

Are there any other Members of the public who would like to participate in public comment on this particular item? Please see Freddy Martin. Yeah,

1:35:48

thank you. I'm actually driving. So I don't know if my connection is not clear. But I did see what was typed in the chat about the funding for this work can come from the board or the mayor. The reason for this meeting is to shed light on the budget process. When the process began, it was an oversight is an eye it was what it was an oversight for asking the question you produce? I think that's what that means. Okay, and then Mayor, and the board president allocated \$180 million. Okay, so I'm, I'm, I'm, I am concerned about this, because I thought I actually thought all the seats were, were getting compensated for their time. And maybe I just misunderstood it when I because I also applied. I'm not sure if I'll be able to reapply just because of my schedule. But I need to get that information. Again, I guess I could find it on the site. I'm glad to hear about the USF reaching out to the students. There. I tried to do an outside project with that. And just because of the timing, it did not work out. But I think that's great. Um, I, I yeah, I'm really concerned about that. And some of the things that have been stated. It's like, it's just, I don't know, it just seems like in some ways, we're getting treated the same, the same old, you know, the same old way. But I know that that's part of this process. And that's why we're fighting. I'm just again, I want to encourage, encourage people, you know, not to give up and keep on doing what we're doing. Because, like Cheryl Davis put in the chat, chat, we you know, we

have gotten some things and that's just evidence that we can, you know, when we're organized like this, and the more people we reach, I think the more we can do so. Thank you for all the work that's been put in for no compensation. I appreciate that.

1:38:08

So before we go to the next speaker, how many hands do we have raise just one

1:38:12

I see de Seligman has been able to reconnect, that is the only person whose hand is raised.

1:38:19

Okay, excellent. We will we will call on D. Seligman in just a moment, I just want to clear up that what has become kind of a thing and in the comments to date, around compensation to and for the committee Members, again, want to make it clear that one, the budget that currently supports, and there is budget that supports the work of the committee is coming out of the Human Rights Commission. Budget. What discussion now is ticket additional and more specifically, specific earmarked budget over and above and outside of the Human Rights Commission budget to support the continuing and ongoing work of the committee? Yes, we can debate where or how that should have happened before, but that's what we're discussing right now. And and secondly, committee Members do receive a stipend monthly for their participation and work on this committee. So again, wanted to just clear up that particular question that has floated through several of the comments with that. Madam Secretary, let's call on de Seligman.

1:39:37

Are you able to be I think,

1:39:39

can you hear me now? Yes, thank you. I'm still not very clear. And Mr. McDonald tried to help me in his remarks just before I came on the committee it My understanding is this committee dissolves when its report is made. And if that's true, and The report comes out in June of 2023. And the mayor's budget and the process doesn't end until the next month in July. But most of the lobbying going on happens in June and my recollection with all the various groups that are trying to, to get money from the city. By that point, it's too late to provide earmark budget because the committee itself has dissolved. And it's also not the right time at that point, because whatever recommendations for monetary Reparations that the committee puts forth to the board of supervisors will not have been approved and processed by the Board of Supervisors. So I'm really very confused as to, given the timing of when the budget process happens in June and July of next year, how that applies to either the work of the committee or to the monetary recommendations of the committee. And so if somebody could help explain that in a little more detail, I would appreciate it.

1:41:11

Thank you for your comment. Are there any other Members of the public who want to comment on the process at this time? Okay, I see no. Dennis Bishop, has, we can only accept public comment one time on this particular item. Dennis Bishop Sam does raise.

1:41:41

Just a quick question. So this is to the committee Members. I saw the comment that advocacy should be shouldn't begin now. And I think it should have been, you know, going on this whole time. But what can citizens not on the committee do to help? Like what, you know, tasks or or, you know, jobs are alike in what ways? The you guys need help in order to get the word out whether whether whether somebody is applying to committee or not just as a as a concerned native second generation native of San Francisco. Thank you.

1:42:31

Thank you. If there are no Members of the public who would like to participate in public comment at this time Chair.

1:42:41

Thank you so much of a communist close. Thank you all for your comments. Before we go into discussion on let me call on director Davis.

1:42:51

I just wanted to clarify and piggyback on one of the comments that came out. That budget process is Radhika explained starts for the department's theoretically late September, we start the process again. But advocacy begins now in terms of the community meetings, in terms of the outlines and the directions that will come from the mayor's office to departments. And so I would say that there are a couple of different places that folks would do advocacy, and that's both committee Members and community Members. There's a phrase that many folks who do advocacy work No, that's called walk the halls basically walking the halls of City Hall, walking the hall and knocking on every door of the board of supervisors and saying to folks that you were interested in talking about budget allocations, beginning that conversation reaching out to different departments coming up with those talking points, but having clarity on what the money amount is that you're asking for, and why I think, you know, supervisor Walton initiated this legislation, he moved this forward, there were several parallel paths, NAACP was doing work. The Mayor's office was launching the dream Keeper Initiative along with supervisor Walton. So I think in that process, there were a lot of things happening and folks made some not assumptions, but there was some confusion about how things were going to be paid for. There was money at the Human Rights Commission, we leverage that. The the real key here is that the committee itself has asked for money to do things. In order to do things the committee needs to ask the board. The the leading sponsor, the folks who actually put this legislation together, that is the Board of Supervisors unanimously passed this. I would say that in addition to advocating to the mayor, part of this is the board. This is legislation that came from the board. The expectation is that you would lobby the folks who introduced this legislation who organized it to give the funding for the things that you've asked for. It is not that this committee has not been supportive to the best of our ability it is that as the process has gone on, the committee has identified ways that they would like to pay for consultants or the people they would like to partner with. There was no money put into the budget for that, because we didn't anticipate or know what exactly what it was that folks wanted. So my request has been, as you asked for things that come with a cost, that we also ask for money to cover those costs. Because currently, there is no budget for the Reparations Advisory Committee outside of our opportunities for all dollars

are guaranteed income dollars, and our dream keeper dollars. So this was to make sure that the committee understood the budget process, and could begin to make to do advocacy for the things that are not currently being paid for.

1:45:47

Thank you, Director Davis. All right. Before we go to other or additional comments or questions from committee Members, let me just lift up a couple of questions that came up during public comments if we can address those. And then we can go to, again, broader discussion and comment. The first one is there was a question regarding the kind of budget or resource allocation requirements put in front of the Asian and Asian Pacific Islanders as as resources were allocated to them.

1:46:27

So I would say, I'm not sure and I'll defer to Brittini and Radhika. But I think that that might be a statewide initiative, there was not a specific San Francisco piece, there are some dollars that sit with DCYF and with department, children, youth and families and with the Human Rights Commission, that are focused on violence prevention strategies, in partnership with API and Black communities, and then there are some other dollars but they are not. I think the 118 is a state initiative, not a city initiative.

1:47:01

Thank you, Director dance. And I had a note and I

1:47:05

know Radek, if you wanted to answer about any local dollars that were allocated.

1:47:12

I'm not ready to speak to that at this moment. But if there is, follow up happy to coordinate with Dr. Davis and Brittini, you.

1:47:22

Thank you. Okay, let's go to committee discussion questions. So please raise your hand so that I can track things. ReMember Barry.

1:47:35

Thank you, Chair. First. I have a question for the lady representing the mayor's office budget. What is the mayor's feelings or not feelings but goal Reparations? Does she support it in her in the budget process? Also? Just so Members of Republicans committee understand I do have concerns about them. Backtracking wholeheartedly, I saw on the news that San Francisco is all of a sudden in a deficit, California is all of a sudden a deficit. And I feel they're gonna use that excuse. So I would like to recommend that this body double down on similar to what Director Davis was saying is lobbying, not lobbying, I guess is not the word walking the halls. And also to find places where we can leverage funds like proposition C money, that money isn't being efficiently spent, there's still plenty of it. The vacancy tax money, that budget, that ballot measure just passed in this November. So using some of those funds for Black or Reparations, rather, funding, also, no offense, but the racial, the Office of racial equity, maybe some of that money because although they're doing good at data and making plans,

there's no accountability for departments that are not carrying out those plans. Also, the Department of homelessness has been a failure. And a lot of their budget is not clear on what they're using it for. That's why they just voted in oversight committee. So the question to the budget presenter is does the mayor support Reparations? Because I'm concerned of anti Blackness, people being catered to and then trying to strike it down. And then a question for Britney director Britney is on the calendar. What I saw in the agenda is this report had to do this month will be presented to the Human Rights Commission, but I did not see a date that it will be presented to the Board of Supervisors. So you can you please advise as to what that date will be so that we can come to chambers? Thank you

1:50:23

we can start with with the mayor's office question and then go to Director teclado.

1:50:34

That That question is really beyond the scope of my my job. I work in the budget office. And so I'm happy to come back, if that's helpful, but I'm not able to answer that question at this time.

1:50:48

Thank you so much, director to Clara.

1:50:53

Thank you, Brittini Chiquita. So on the question of when we would, when this body would go before the Board of Supervisors, so in item six will talk in greater detail, or excuse me, I believe it's seven. But we have to submit a resolution to the clerk of the Board of Supervisors essentially requesting a date when we would be assigned to a committee and present the Reparations plan. So it is at the discretion of the Board of Supervisors, but we will submit a resolution and then they will give us a date.

1:51:33

Thank you, there was also a question related to similarly, the Human Rights Commission.

1:51:41

So, um, the resolution that we are submitting will be sent to the mayor's office, the board of supervisors and the commissioners of the Human Rights Commission. And so it is at the discretion of the seated bodies when a meeting will be held to discuss the draft Reparations plan.

1:51:59

Excuse me. Thank you. Okay. Those are the questions listed. I heard and held coming out of public comment. Any other comments from committee Members and or questions around this item? In terms of the for 2023? Forward calendar? Review?

1:52:22

Okay, seeing none, thank you so much. Radhika, and Director Chicuata for that item and guiding us so we appreciate it and we will close this item. Thank you so much. Please call the next time.

1:52:41

6. REVIEW THE DRAFT SAN FRANCISCO REPARATIONS PLAN (*Discussion Item*)

The San Francisco African American Reparations Advisory Committee will review the "Draft San Francisco Reparations Plan" that will be submitted to the San Francisco Board of Supervisors, Mayor's office, and Human Rights Commission, in compliance with Ordinance NO. 259-20.

Presentation: **Brittini Chicuata**, Director, Economic Justice Division, San Francisco Human Rights Commission

Juell Stewart, Manager, Economic Rights Justice, San Francisco Human Rights Commission

Public Comment

Committee Discussion

Item number six is reviewed the draft San Francisco Reparations plan. This is a discussion item. The San Francisco African American Reparations Advisory Committee will review the draft San Francisco Reparations plan that will be submitted that the San Francisco Board of Supervisors Mayor's office and Human Rights Commission in compliance with ordinance number 259 dash two zero presentation from Brittini each Aquata, director of the Economic Rights Division San Francisco Human Rights Commission, and Joelle Stewart, there will be public comment on this item and committee discussion.

1:53:20

Thank you so much. So we will first hear from director to Quadra and John Stuart, we will then go to public comment. And then we will return to the committee for questions and discussion. Thank you.

1:53:35

Thank you. I'd actually like to ask Dr. Davis to first speak.

1:53:41

Thank you. I just wanted to because I know there was a couple of comments in the chat, as well. I just wanted to say as we develop and put out the report, I'm not sure that everybody's timelines or some of the things will all mesh and agree. But I will say that when the committee was launched, Reverend Brown and the NAACP had been in conversation with both Mayor Breed and President Walton. President Walton had been doing his own research and then some level of engagement and work and was already moving forward after he had had conversations with Mayor Breed. And at the same time, we were launching the Dream Keeper initiative and other things were happening. So there was there may be as we put all of this out confusion about what came first and who came first and whose idea it was or who was involved and who wasn't. And I just want to recognize and acknowledge that Reverend Brown and the NAACP, were doing some work that was on a parallel path with what President Walton was moving. And during that time, President Walton was having conversations in community and had hosted several meetings and engagements as well as had conversations about launching the Dream Keeper Initiative as well as this. So in the context of this, we're going to try and do our best to like, get the stories, right and honor the truths that folks have, but also just recognize that at some point all the paths converge, and that we all are moving towards the same goal, but that we may not agree on how we all got there. So I just want to acknowledge and thank Reverend Brown for his leadership and work in that regard, but also recognize and appreciate that President Walton was doing his own research

and investigation and having conversations with different community partners, as well as the mayor and the NAACP as he developed and launched this resolution or legislation.

1:55:40

Thank you, Director Davis. So good evening, Members of the public and Members of the African American Reparations Advisory Committee. My name is Brittini Chicuata, Director of Economic Rights at the Human Rights Commission. And I just want to start by saying thank you to each and every person who has contributed to the point that we are at at this time with our draft San Francisco Reparations plan. And I think that it is no small feat that after 18 months, and just as many public meetings that we have, are ready to submit this living document. And so I also want to begin by thanking my colleagues at the Human Rights Commission for your work on getting this draft plan. Juell Stuart, who was the lead writer on this and helped us to organize all of our thoughts and get them this document constructed. Zachman well, and Jeanette Coates Muthiah Phillips, so I mentioned earlier who interviewed each of the panelists, it has definitely been a group effort. And so for my portion of this conversation, I want to focus on the final draft of the eligibility requirements. And one, I want to apologize that I was not here at the meeting where this was discussed. I mean, I don't completely apologize because I was in Mexico. But I'm sorry that after drafting it per the chairs, direction that I wasn't here to answer the questions as they came up. And I reviewed the last video. And I know it was a very robust discussion. And so we wanted to number one, just go through the eligibility. But first, let me just say, you know, we've gotten to this point, because, as Dr. Davis mentioned, there has been no shortage of voices from the public who have demanded rightfully demanded Reparations for San Francisco's Black citizens. And for the continued marginalization and continued racial trauma that Black citizens in San Francisco have phased. And we know that this report is joining a broad contemporary moment around Reparations, specifically, the expanding and expanding on the understanding of the role that city governments have played in perpetuating harms that further marginalized Black communities. And so for this report, and for the for the San Francisco specific work as has come up across this meeting. This is different from the California Taskforce, and their eligibility and criteria and their recommendations, which came out at the top of the month. And I think that that may have caused a bit of confusion because of the coverage there. But if you look through the recommendations, which are towards the end of the document, we haven't changed anything that has been put forward. And that has been discussed by this committee, because we are not here to undermine that process in any way. Our role as the HRC has been to be a backbone for the committee to help with collecting and cataloging all of the recommendations as they have been mentioned, both in these full body spaces, as well as the listening sessions, as well as the personal emails that we have received. And present that back to you, as you have stated, because this is your work, and these are your demands, and we're not trying to color or change them in any way or, you know, put our thumb on the scale at all. It's really just to be a support and to collect the thoughts in a comprehensive way. And so really, this report is looking at the legacy of civic civic dis investment that this committee and Members of the public have discussed continuously and and really wanted to capture the findings that there while there have been various probic programmatic and policy decisions by San Francisco's government And that those have been generational and overlapping. We know that decisions. Consistent city, private and public decisions have played a significant role in undermining Black San Franciscans and our wealth actively displaced violently displaced the city's Black population. And we really kind of honed in on the period around urban renewal, because we know that as the growth of San Francisco's African American

population accelerated between 1940 and 1963, that public and private entities were facilitating and coddling conditions that excluded Black communities from political participation disinvested from academic and cultural institutions, and intentionally disrupted and displaced Black communities. So I'll jump to the eligibility list. Now, please. And we just wanted to highlight this, because we have gone over the recommendations a number of times, but we did want to reflect that we were listening to the feedback that came from the last meeting. So if you could go to the next page, please. So we changed and moved up, that an individual must have identified and must identify on public documents as Black or African American, because as vice chair Collins was saying, if we are not being if you are not moving forward with saying that this is for Black people, then should we even call it Reparations. So that has been moved up per your recommendation and for the feedback from the public that came at the last meeting. Additionally, the number of years for a person who has had residency was changed to 13 years based on trying to demonstrate generational impact versus it was at 10 years previously. We added having a record of attendance in San Francisco Public goals at the time of the consent decree. Can you go to the next slide, please? We also added the that you're listed are the direct descendant of a certificate of preference holder. And I'm not sure what might be on the previous page. But I thought that we also added an item about was it I think it was the foster care system Vice Chair Hollins, you might know better. But we discussed this, and I'm not seeing it on there. So it looks like one is missing around a person who was in the foster care system. But yes, just wanted to put the these updated items on the checklist before you. And just like the rationale for how we reached this beyond like the feedback that you've gotten is that typically, as we have discussed at large, you have to use some type of proxy for identity. And so we're trying to be as specific as possible to make sure that, you know, beyond the required that we're capturing people who have been in San Francisco have helped to build San Francisco and have directly been impacted and harmed and experienced continued harm by San Francisco's decisions. So I will pass it to Juell. Can you go back to that last slide? Or where's this available? It's in the draft report. And you can also put a PDF in the chat. Thank you.

2:04:04

Okay, good evening, everybody. I am Juell Stewart. I work at the Human Rights Commission and I have been working alongside Brittni Chicuata And our other colleagues on the Reparations report. And I just wanted to share Cathy put a my colleague Cathy Mulkey Meyer put a link to the draft Reparations plan into the chat box. So Members of the public click, please feel free to click on that copy of the PDF. And I'm going to share my screen and we'll talk about the a little bit about the draft report itself. So, you know, it's hard to go over a full draft with a you know, dozens of people right now. So we're gonna go over I'm going to talk about Have the outline. And you guys can feel free to review. Of course, my computer's doing something weird. That's great. You guys can review the full document and email the Reparations at SF. gov email address, if you have any updates, and we did get a lot of feedback from the we got a lot of feedback from people from on the recommendations in the form that we sent out. So thank you, for everybody who responded to that. Let me stop sharing my screen right now. I'm sorry, of course my computer design decides to do whatever it's doing, when it's the least appropriate time to do that. So I don't know what's going on with that. So everybody, you guys can take a look at the full document, the link is in the chat once again. And basically, we wanted to make this draft really focus on the narrative, because narrative is really important in you know, in this work, it's probably the most important thing. So we wanted to get a, we've met with the committee Members that the subcommittee leads, get the feedback, they're all the outreach that we've done. So, you know, up till this point, we

incorporated that in this draft and lay the con, you know, laid out the context of what was going on, just like Brittini said talk going through the going through, like the decades and really making a case for the Thank you. Yeah, making a case for the harms. Thanks for putting that up. So you know, just going through the committee itself, talking about the past harms, throughout its history and highlighting notable figures throughout Black history, Black San Francisco history, because another thing we thought was really important was that this be a document that's not just a legal document or a, you know, a report, but something that really gives the credit that is due to Black San Francisco. So we I thank the committee Members, especially Member Hamilton for really pointing out the nuances and consequences that happened even though events may have happened in one specific San Francisco community effect, you know, it affects all of us, all of Black San Francisco. So if you could move forward in that, thank you so much for the swaying that. So you can see a little bit here about what our thought process was in offering that historical context, as we said, identifying the migration patterns around World War Two, even though you know, we note that Black people were here before that, but this is really when that population boom starts happening. And then when the backlash starts happening for the against the Black community. You know, we were I say we but I didn't grow up here. But Black people were excluded from many parts of San Francisco, because of just because of race. And so you know, that's something that we all know, but putting that into context about how this was a federal issue. You know, it was a directive that happened federally that went down to the state level, and then was codified by the San Francisco Redevelopment Agency, and it displaced 1000s of Black residents specifically and parked it. And so then we talk about the present as well. Something that we really wanted to do two is highlight the, as Brittini said, In this third part, we're talking about the past city Commission's and reports, because we thought it was really important to focus to highlight the this many things. We've heard many times in these meetings, why are we doing this? Again, we've studied this already what's going to come of it, you know, and that is, you know, it's valid feedback. And so we wanted to elevate the fact that this these reports have happened before, and many of the reports echo what, that got the same harms that we identified through this process, and also echoes many of the same solutions. And so we wanted to reinforce that with saying like, you know, these, it's, we don't need to reinvent the wheel. But here you Here you go, here's a wheel that we have. But, you know, so we go through the unfinished agenda, then we go, like, historically, there were a few reports that really stood out, you know, and they talked about the population decline, the economic shifts between 1964 and 1990. And, you know, we highlighted some of the goals that were in that in that report, and, you know, program initiatives and some to the city's credit as director Davis said, some have been implemented already throughout Um, you know, starting in 2020, but there's so some things that are outstanding. And so we really wanted to focus on that. And I think my colleague, Zach man, well for going through those reports, and really identifying the, the overlap. And so there's, there's quite a bit as you can see, and again, this isn't the full report. But this is just an outline form to make it a little bit easier to talk about. This was the outline that we use to write them for it. And so you know, you can see homeownership came up as something that was fundamental in this past report, you know, in the early 2000s, and homeownership is coming up again, it's not, it's not a new thing, you know, not to belabor the point, but we wanted to echo that. And so the recommendations, you know, echo throughout history as well, history repeats itself quite a bit. And then from that, we also, we also talked about the report that created HRC, and then 2020, we thought it was important to highlight the ongoing efforts to so then we also talked about the California State Reparations committee and offer context there, and their report, if you all have not seeing that full report and mentioned San Francisco, specifically many times.

And then we get to the actual San Francisco, African American Reparations, advisory committee recommendations. And so there were a few recommendations, that overall recommendations that came that were a common thread throughout the subcommittee recommendations. And so we elevated those to be, you know, just like common recommendations, I think it like, you know, created the Office of Reparations within the city. That's something that came up. I think someone commented on that, and the public comment earlier this evening. And so an oversight committee, thanks to help with the continuity of this body was really important, and people pointed that out. And then we get to the recommendations by subcommittee, all of which are, you know, LinkedIn there, but in the full document, all of the recommendations are out there. And so we really wanted to, and then we have recommendations that were elevated through the proper process. But those recommendations kind of like fit in to the subcommittee recommendations. And so that was really good, too. And something that I wanted to also point out, is that we want this to be a document as we talk, thank you so much for sharing that, as we talked about, that we wanted this document to be a living document, and sort of instructive of how like a blueprint going forward, these are things that you can advocate for, this is how you can plug in. And so we're still working on that element of it, when we'll be working on that through, you know, between now and June, the final submission and ongoing doing the ongoing community engagement process as well. But you know, we want this to be the reality is that it's going to take the whole community, as we've mentioned, to advocate for, for Reparations, as, as we've mentioned many times, and so the real focus on this iteration of the report that's going to be submitted next Friday, was to highlight those, like, you know, give the recommendations themselves. And so spin that narrative. But we'll, we'll also be adding to this report, before it is submitted, the final version is submitted in June with more feedback, more context, more analysis, like with our partners, Dr. Lynch, and USF and other institutional partners. And so this isn't the final version of it. But we still want feedback and welcome feedback, as Director Davis and Brittini have pointed out, and so that's the please read through it. Tell us what you think, email us happy to hear from you. But yes, that is a little bit of what you know, a little bit of context as to how this report came together. Thank you.

2:14:11

Thank you. Thank you, for up to two quarter for your presentation on the eligibility criteria. And so we have the sum total, at least of the current iteration. Let me say this just before we go to public comment, just as a reminder, and we'll repeat it again before we conclude this item. So the deadline for input feedback, edits, etc. is Monday the 19th of December, so that the final version of the draft recommendations will be submitted to the board of supervisors to me as office and Human Rights Commission on Friday the 23rd. With that, let's go to public comment, please and then we'll return for The committee discussion.

2:15:03

Members of the public means the raised hand icon to indicate you would like to participate in public comment on this item, the draft report. Public comment will be three minutes. I do see Robert Reinhart first. Welcome. Can you unmute yourself?

2:15:29

Can you hear me now? Yes. Thank you. Yeah. I'm Robert Reinhardt. And I work within the health and general welfare committee of the San Francisco, Black and Jewish unity coalition. And our committee

also participated a little bit in the November 7, special Advisory Committee meeting, where health recommendations were discussed. So I'm trying to square that very robust and important discussion with what's now in the draft. And I just want to point out one helpful edit or addition to the draft report. Now, the Health Committee of the Reparations Advisory Committee noted the significant disparity in life expectancy between Black populations in San Francisco and everyone else, more than 10 years of life expectancy discrepancy. And for Black males, it's even worse, the life expectancy of a Black male in San Francisco is only 68 and a half years. And in this current draft of the report, I think, as was pointed out, there's some restatement of the history or background or context. And on pages 14 and 15th of this draft, you see some of the telling important figures about health issues, I think it would be very helpful to insert a sentence about this unconscionable disparity in life expectancy because it's such a significant catch all, for so many health issues, not just direct problems with specific diseases, but social determinants of health, access to health, all those things are factors in why this disparity exists. So if that could be one of the things that makes it into the report as it goes forward. And, of course, action items around that. We have proposed having the Health Commission take up life expectancy as a deliberate, separate item. Of course, we would appreciate that kind of work as well. Those are my comments. And thank you for allowing me this time.

2:17:51

Thank you. Now I'd like to welcome Kenneth Johnson. Can you unmute Mr. Johnson? Yeah,

2:17:59

hi, everybody. I just, I just got in forgive me. But I'd like to know if the report. I've heard on the news over the weekend. And last week that it was founded that because of discrimination, Black folks, we supposed to get 200,000 out of the piece. I don't know if anybody else had heard that on on the radio. But it came out that each Black person in California, African American or she'll get \$200,000. And I want to know, I want to know if that's in the report, or Did anybody hear that? It was some kind of big committee. Maybe was the State Committee on Reparations. But they figured that what I just said. So I'd like to know if anybody else heard that. And if if you guys did cover that before I came on, because I just got home.

2:19:16

Thank you, Mr. Johnson. Now I'd like to welcome Alyssa Jones GCathyardener, our gardener, excuse me.

2:19:25

Thank you. I'd first like to thank the committee Member Juell for addressing the underlying sentiment in the row in regards to the excessive demand being placed on Black people to justify our existence and our needs, in demand are our equitable treatment in this society, because that's what you were hearing. It may have come off as frustration. But that's the That's a sentiment that that a lot of us are feeling. I would like to speak in support of the work that the Reparations committee is doing and the need for it. The fact that you're addressing these multiple aspects of the lived experience of Black people, it will only help to benefit us not only in justifying the need for Reparations, but the depth and breadth to which racism, discrimination, and race based prejudice has impacted the lives of generations of Black people in the city. I had a question about the draft checklist for criteria for applying, will

something be stated or included, for parents that have young children that have been impacted by racism and discrimination in this city? And will they also be eligible to apply for their children? For Reparations? I say that, as someone who's been a caregiver for many children that have been horribly treated within not only our school system, but our healthcare system in San Francisco, purely because of their race, denied service, denied equitable treatment, stereotyped denied services within our education and health care systems. And I feel it's important that not only for the adults in the room that we fight for ourselves, but that we do and make sure that we have an avenue to fight for our children as well.

2:21:45

Thank you. Thank you. Dr. Thompkins. I see your hand raise. Can you unmute yourself? Do you mean? Hello?

2:22:04

Oh. Earlier I for some reason I couldn't get through are recognized. I had a question previously dealing with the financial process. And that putting in and I somewhat echoed the concern of disrespect toward towards the concept of Reparations, when we're going to have to battle out during the regular period of time where everybody else all the other departments to the mayor's office, are you suggesting that in terms of in the health department's budget, that they will address the issues of health care of the African American community? Will there be set dollar amount? I'd like to know that, if not at this meeting at a next coming up meeting? And will the mayor override, because I spoke to the director of the southeast clinic when he made a petition to get Black doctors over at the southeast clinic that the HR committee said they couldn't do that, or make any priorities and that was reverse discrimination. Can we get PLAs this stupidity for a kind of word, and deal with the medical issues that are addressing and that are contributing to the previous speaker talking about the life expectancy, right? It's even in the past, it was even worse for African American males. It was 58 years. In 91. I started at the southeast clinic in 94. With Cynthia Selma was director and for African American women and Dr. Tomas Aragon did the breast cancer study that he put out there, that given all the socio economic factors of education, income and everything else, African American women have a 77% higher mortality rate than her white counterparts. These are issues that have been established, but yet have not been addressed. So I'd like to get some guidance on understanding how is the mayor going to prioritize this, and I really feel insulted. If Reparations you're telling us we have to go fight all these other organizations and not putting a financial set aside to address these issues. I haven't had any clarity. I'm very confused on this. And if I can get clarity on this matter would be deeply appreciated. And I wish that then if the board here, what asked the Air District to provide my report on genetic susceptibility and the air studies that we did over a 20 year period in Bayview Hunters Point with samples Cisco state university that I was a faculty Member of. Thank you.

2:25:06

Thank you, Dr. Tompkins. Now I'd like to welcome Members of the public McNeely. Welcome.

2:25:17

Hello, everybody. I just had I had a few questions and some comments. I first wanted to address the checklist for eligibility, the draft checklist, I don't know if it was just kind of placed on the presentation

kind of weirdly, or, or what because there was kind of two screens and I screenshotted them. First of all, I'm in support for lineage based Reparations. Again, I'm gonna say it five times so that we can get as it lineage base Reparations, lineage based Reparations, lineage based Reparations, that should be the first requirement, not a part of the checklist. It should be folks who are classified as descendants of chattel slavery. And in addition to that, there is a precedent, we were called freedmen. by the federal government after slavery was abolished, we were we were classified as freedmen. So even if that was the requirement, because under this checklist, again, folks who are of African descent or Caribbean descent, who identify as Black, they would qualify under these, these elegant eligibility checklists that we have in will, from what I see right now. So again, I couldn't have been making, I could have read this wrong because you know, it's on two separate on the presentation, it was on two different charts or whatever. But again, we should probably talk about establishing a San Francisco Freedmen's Bureau, I saw it was on the second presentation, establishing a thing with the city, it should be the Freedmen's Bureau, they can help with genealogie, with eligibility for criteria with discrimination, complaints and legal help, eventually opening a bank, helping with housing, health care, resources and education. In August of 2022, Gavin Newsom signed Senate Bill 189, that's going to that's going to authorize the Department of Human Resources to delineate Black Americans who are descendants of chattel slavery who are freedmen, from other Black identifying groups, it is very important that we do this right. Again, San Francisco Reparations Task Force, the entire country is looking at you. Lineage based Reparations should be the first eligibility requirement, not, you know, a part of a criteria, it should be the requirement. That is really what I want to drive home. And I don't know why that's something that should even be at this point, a bone of contention. It's literally the requirement, lineage based Reparations for the descendants of American chattel slavery.

2:28:19

Thank you. LaDonna Williams, you are next with your hand raised?

2:28:27

Yes, I just wanted to say thank you, to the committee Members tour for clarifying a lot of the confusion that we have going on. But I did want to ask a question about the children of, say, a parent or guardian, if they are entitled to adoption or whatever. But are they entitled if they don't fall within that age range, but their parents did. And Case in point, there is a community Member whose parent just recently passed away that falls within that age group. However, her children her remaining children do not they're younger, they're I think, in 2000, but she felt falls within that realm. And then the other thing I wanted to say was, we have to also be prepared to go into this with no supporters. If we keep hearing what we have to have our allies. Well, of course, we want those allies we, we, you know, really want that support. But if we don't get it, we need to be prepared to be moving hard, and unapologetically. Because if you look at what is being put out now, it's been out for quite some time and I'm sure you all might have been seeing it but you have these various groups in particular Diller, these Asian groups through this Pacific Legal Foundation, who is on YouTube, blatantly saying that they are going to oppose this plan that has been put forward? The same thing with some of these Latino groups saying the same thing. They're opposing Reparations, specifically for Blacks, because they're not responsible for our suffering yet, we can turn that same table back and say, Excuse me, but Black folks aren't responsible for your suffering, either. Yet, you've been allowed to come over here. And not only have you been allowed to come over here, but our Black leaders in 1978 led the charge to support

particularly Cambodians, I believe it was or Indonesians maybe, but they were of Asian descent. And our Black leaders rally together and supported them coming over here so that they can have a better way of life. Many of them went on to become doctors and lawyers, and what have you only to turn around and use that against us. And that is coming from some of their own Asian folks who are saying they are just now in their 50s and 60s, coming to the realization of what has been done for them. So you know, I want to compliment you, I've got just a headache that feels like a volcano, I can only imagine what you all are going through doing this work. But you know, we need to cut all this talk out and get to it now. Thank you.

2:31:32

Thank you. Are there any other Members of the public attending the meeting who would like to comment on the plan, the draft plan, or the Eligibility Lists that were presented please use the raise hand icon. Dennis Bishop

2:31:59

I want to thank the committee Members for all your work. And I'm I'm basically reiterating something comment I made in an earlier meeting. But Black wealth is trending towards zero. And the discrepancies in the in the historical discrimination has been institutional. And so any Reparations that we put put forward should also be as institutional right, it should be at an institutional level. Because if you just, you know, address it at a monetary level, that money ends up back into the same system, right? It just it just, you, you, you're not you're not actually fixing a lot of the underlying problems. And I haven't read the report yet, but I will. So I could be, you know, speaking out of line. But, um, I, so one of the reasons why I got into tech was to address some of the stuff. And there are some organizations and I'll put a question in the q&a, there are some organizations I believe can help with with some of this work if you guys are open to it. But I, I think about a world in which my kids have to grow up when, with Black wealth being zero, and it scares me. Right? This being the seat of technology in one of the seats of technology in the world, definitely the seat of technology in the United States. I believe we have a unique, we're in a unique position, and we have a unique responsibility to address this stuff. And I think, you know, the historical significance of this cannot be understated, as a few people have already put forth. And so but again, I like to say I thank you guys for your work. You know, if, however, we can grease the wheels, whatever we can do to get the job done outreach. You know, making sure the community is you know, is on board. I'm down to help. Yeah, that, you know, that's really all I have to say I'm a I'm a second generation citizen of second generation native born here in San Francisco. And you know, just just really want to do my part, like this is part of my mission. So let me know.

2:34:58

Thank you Sure, Tom, Carrie. Can you unmute yourself?

2:35:08

Hello, good evening, everyone. And thank you to the committee. I want to speak about the eligibility requirements. And I'm very curious about the two requirements that you have listed there. And might there be the opportunity to one reiterate what someone else kind of spoke about, and that is sort of add in the freedom and language to the requirements. And then the other thing that becomes tricky is I see something that says about public documents. And I'm wondering if there can be something that's very

specific, either a birth certificate or something different, because public documents just seems to be a little bit too loosey. Loose. And so I'm making that recommendation to the committee, as some as something to really review. Because, again, if we're thinking about making this very specific, I want to make sure that public document is something that can't be generalized in other areas, because we're using language to say I identify as Black identifies African American, and I would ask the committee to think deeper, and how do we get very much more specific around that? Thank you.

2:36:19

Thank you. Are there any other Members of the public attending this meeting who would like to participate in public comment on the draft plan? Chairman normal Vice Chair Hollins, I do not see anyone indicating they would like to participate in public comment.

2:36:42

Seeing none public comment is closed. Thank you all so much. We always appreciate your comments and contributions to this work. So we're going to come to committee discussions, questions, etc. I am going to call on Reverend Brown first, since he raised his hand three items ago to make comments. So we will start with Reverend Brown and then I see your hand. ReMember, Barry. And just as a point of of not clarity, but understanding this is a discussion item only. So there is not a decision to be made this evening. Ron Brown.

2:37:16

Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Members of Taz force Advisory Committee. As I said early on, we should commend the leadership of this taskforce. But with all of our different personalities and perspectives, Jefferson has done an outstanding job

2:37:44

keeping us on point and our show, but permitting us all to speak out piece. Secondly, the staff has done an outstanding job of being recorders and making sure what we said and hope to do would be recorded adequately and accurately. And I would like to do two quick things. Because I'm serving on the state task force as vice chair, we invite you to not pay any attention to that spin. That yellow journalistic reporter from the New York Times put on the idea of Reparations as suggesting that our state task force had recommended a figure there's no truth in that. We are deliberative body the same as this is a deliberative body. And no vote was taken. That was just somebody out there making up something. But if we're not careful, these kinds of slick people was try and set us up to implode and do end up going around chasing our tails in a skunk fight. And we don't want to do that. We want to have something of substance that's going to be in my estimation for the good of the people, the people for the people's good. And number two, that's politically practical. To give something like this through you got to be a practical politician. And knowing what buttons to push, where when and how There's a reason why our first African American male of this city, Willie Brown, was so successful became an astute political leader having that long term as speaker of that assembly. And he always said, if you're going to go into this practical field politics of trying to make the possible reality, you better know how to count. And you better know who to talk to. And who to hang with, to get to what we want for the people, good. The people's good. And my little personal evaluation estimation is we should be about one boom to because we are therefore I am not be about trying to push rugged individualism. That's what has got us

all messed up. But this extreme, rugged, individualistic, greedy, capitalistic world that has caused so many of us to be down at the bottom, and only just a handful, up at the top. Next thing I want to say, as an old rugged, history buff, I think that we should be careful not to toot our own horn. But to tell the truth. The establishment is down for too much to misrepresent our history. Instead of it being history. It was as somebody said, his story, or her story, and not our story. And our story about this taskforce from day one is that the oldest, the largest, the most feared the most revered civil rights organization in the world. The National Association for the Advancement of Colored People, is the body that first broached the idea of Reparations here in the city and county of San Francisco in an official way. And the record reveals that that we went to Members of the Board of Supervisors. And also we brought in to the city that iconic follow Danny Glover to push reparation. And number two in terms of telling our story. It was brother, c'mon, Walton, who caught the spirit and joined us and was you to give us the crafting of the legislation to establish this task force. And at the end of the day, I trust and hope that we will stay on point and come to the end of this journey, saying look at what we did, as a collective body for the good of our people in the areas of health, education, economic empowerment, restoring our watering hole, that feel more center, making sure we deal with this criminal justice system. Well, far too many of our young men and young ladies have been wrongly locked up and have not received justice have not been involved in restorative justice programs, but need to come back to our communities and be here with their families, in our organizations, and our faith communities, and doing those things that really make us a great people who know how to make a way out of no way in spite of what has been thrown at us. And it will continue to be thrown at us. Just think about it. Why not one down there and Georgia in spite of all the efforts of the enemy. But even after we had that great victory what happened another day here comes cinema to spoil everything. And Neverland should we naively think that we're gonna have victory even in the city of St. Francis. That is going to be because somebody that has a moral conscious has the goodness of heart. But we got to be smart enough to know how to say the right things at the right place at the right time and push the right buttons and change this situation. And this city where we are still, as someone else said even from another editor Room is a shame before God all the profits, merit and Mazel that we don't get our full days in this earth, and it will become mute and immaterial. If we even talk about Reparations that we're still the thickets, we'll still those persons whose days are cut off, because we haven't been eating right, because we haven't gotten medical help. And that's the reason why I thank God for that brother who said, We ought to have in Bayview Hunters Point, a holistic health center. You can't go nowhere if you sit if you're weak. And secondly, we need education. We got to be on this city, the school board and say to them, since you take so much from us, you owe it to us to come up with program is not being discriminatory. When my teacher Martin Luther King said, if American, and in his city has organized to do bad things against a negro called his Negroes in, we must organize and do good thing with the Negro for the betterment of the Negro. And that's what reparation is about. That's what affirmative action is all about. So I say to all right, on, Let's love each other, hang together. And when it comes time to go to the board of supervisors, bring everybody to re re Samantha salmon in order that we would say, in large numbers, just do what you've done for others who are wrong. And when we do that, we will win the day. Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I know a bit of the lesson. Thank you, Sherman. Yes. Oh, the five? Yes, sir.

2:47:06

We appreciate you for. Yes,

2:47:10

thank all of you. And God will put smiles on our faces. Because we will have shown the world that we know how to love each other, and to fight in spite of the hill that has been thrown at us, even since California became a state.

2:47:28

Thank you, sir. Appreciate you appreciate your leadership, both now. And over time. I'm not sure whether to open the doors of the church or ask for an offering. I'm just not sure where to go right now. But we're gonna go to the next speaker, and keep it moving this very pleased.

2:47:47

Yeah, I have to follow up after and Reverend Brown oops. But let's go. So far as the report is concerned, I want to thank Brittini and UL for their tireless work to put our paraphrases in our little suggestions into articular details. Can't be easy. So thank you. And I want to address the eligibility I hear at a public and I hear actually Members of the of this body who is kind of a conflict of whether we go with descendants of slaves, or someone who identifies as Black through public records. So perhaps that's something we could put on the agenda later on to vote on and get more input. Because now that I see the criteria, I see that. And just to give you an example, I mentioned before I worked for the Census as assistant Operations Manager. And there's a lot of people from Central America and South America that identify as Black, went to public school and have been the jail. So they would be able to get Reparations, and the more we leave the door open, the less money, individual issues or departments or whatever we're going to have will will be funded. And then I wanted to add that in the criteria list is someone who's been incarcerated due to the war on drugs. I just needed to know if it's specifically incarcerated in San Francisco, or anywhere, Louisiana, wherever. And then, as far as the education portion of the report, by me being the lead on that. I want to make sure that we articulate that nonprofits that receive any RFP money for Reparations, that is clearly states that that's what they'll use that money for. And also, I wanted to make clear that the school district and school board when it comes to our ass Through Reparations that the Board of Supervisors, it has no authority over them, and can't tell them to do anything. So we often see money go to the school district from the city to save them. And that we get funds earmarked for specific disparities in education when it comes to Black people. And then lastly, I want to get us rolling on the budget issue. I don't feel it was sufficient to have someone come in and say the struggle is real when it comes to budget. And now we all got to go to advocate for funding from the city for Reparations when we were never told that. So now that that's what we got to do. We need more advice on how that's done, what dates we need to be where, and also, we've been asking for a long time for financial consultants on budget, because none of us are that I know of our accountants, and can even come up with the numbers for our recommendations. So I hope that we can get more budget and more money of how much this all will cause in the budget. And other than that, that is it. Thank you.

2:51:26

Thank you reMember Barry, Vice Chair Hollins. Thank you, Chair,

2:51:32

thank you to Brittini and Jewell for the presentation, all of your work, really appreciate how you all were able to codify everything. Um, two things. One is, Member Berry, the point that you raised about making sure that we are San Francisco specific game that the systems are so broad, and people will come through them in all kinds of different ways. I think that's important. So the two recommendations that I was uplifting in eligibility criteria, one around being impacted by the war on drugs, maybe we can add to that that individual have been gone through the system in San Francisco, the criminal legal system in San Francisco and or had a San Francisco address, there has to be something tying them to San Francisco, not someone who came through San Francisco may have committed a crime or been convicted of a crime in San Francisco, but they actually are from here. The second one, who I'm sorry, I've been trying to work through some language here. And I didn't think that would have me this emotional, but we have to make sure that we have an eligibility criteria that speaks to how the government systematically targeted and broke apart our families. And so I want to make sure that we have something in there that speaks specifically to Black individuals and families that were fragmented by the child welfare system. So we can all put some language in the chat. But I'm thinking that an individual whose family unit was fragmented by temporary or permanent removal through the child welfare system in San Francisco, or who was placed into custody in San Francisco. So whether they were placed in custody in San Francisco or out of custody, we can also talk about, I want to make sure that family Members, grandmothers, aunties, uncles, people who also had to assume the responsibility of caring for children and families who were put into the system are able to meet the eligibility requirement if they are in San Francisco as well. So I will drop that language in but that is another eligibility requirement. I like

2:53:35

to see added Thank you.

2:53:37

Thank you. ReMember, ekanem

2:53:42

Thank you so much, Chair, and thank you, Vice Chair and Member very for your comments. For me, I just wanted to also just thank Brittini and Joelle for for this work. It's just incredible. Thank you so much for I think under the eligibility requirements, I think some of the languaging still needs to be sort of tightened up. For example, the first one, if I'm envisioning this going on for a very long time, right, and I could totally see someone wanting to change their birth certificate or whatever else or, or whatever the public document is to say, Black for 10 years, right? We just want to get through this because, again, the way I think about it, right, this is gonna be going on for a very long time. So we just need to do something like around that. In addition, we have requirements for everything else, but the one thing we don't have a requirement for is around health care, right, or the lack of health care that we have gotten or any health care with sort of related issues. So not that I have any specific language, but I think that you know, we have economic we have education, etc. I think something around healthcare not having health care not being able to access it. We have Someone I think in a previous meeting, just give a heartbreaking testimony to infant mortality within the Black community. And so taking a look at something like that, as a measure, here, I think would be really important. And then lastly, just wanted to sort of speak to the recommendation of the economic empowerment subcommittee. And just to be

really clear, we said 5 million initially, we mean that that is in this report. We also said, and this goes for all the recommendations that this is an ongoing, if we had to 150 years to get us to this point. And this needs to sort of extend for 2050 years into the future. So that's the framework that we're working towards. So even on a yearly basis now, within the economic empowerment recommendations, and just reiterate, because there was some confusion about this. On our side, what we're saying is that needs to be tied to your meeting income for every Black person who qualifies, okay, so just want to make sure that that's on the table, people are really clear about that. That's in the report Juell. And Brittini has done a really great, great job at sort of uplifting the language even more, and I really do appreciate that. So thank you so much, Chair.

2:56:21

Thank you.

2:56:23

Excuse me. Thank you so much, Member Erving.

2:56:27

Thank you. Again, deep appreciation to the HRC staff, and all of your work, I did get a chance to just kind of scan through and I definitely see that you left everything in there. And I appreciate the condensed list for the eligibility requirements. I wanted to just echo two different comments from our public. And I'm sorry, I can't see the names right now. But one of the sources say that when we talk about public documents that we are specific, so I wanted to echo that just to make sure that we add that as a consideration what those specific documents are. And then there was another comment earlier on, that talked about including language, not in the eligibility, but in the plan itself, that funding would continue, it's in the q&a funding would continue, as long as the harm is perpetuated, or something like that. And so I wanted to uplift that again, and act that we put that language out for consideration of this body.

2:57:27

Thank you. Thank you Member Erving. Other Other comments or questions? Excuse me? From Members? Okay, Seeing and hearing none, let me just offer a couple of comments brief, I promise. I'm hungry, dinner's waiting for me. On again, echoing the thanks. The community as well as the committee has brought a lot into a space and the team. Excuse me, the staff team to well, Brittini, sack stepping in. Most recently, I've done a fantastic job of synthesizing both creating a narrative that could then support and make context set context rather, for the recommendations. Excuse me as we have them. And so really appreciate that. I echo in particular, the last comment that Member Erving noted from community around the perpetuation if you will of redress as long as harm persists, and so to want to think about ways of incorporating that. And then lastly, wanted to, I guess, offer my continuing point of view because it hasn't shifted since our beginning, which is that the centuries of harm should be met with centuries of repair. And so all of the ways we can kind of inculcate that and embed that into the very DNA of not just his report, but the final report, which in my mind includes not only the content and substance of the report, as it stands today, that we also include the the identification establishment of the entity or entities that hold us work going forward, that there is a perpetual set of funding streams etc. Other things we've talked about some just want to affirm all of that directionally. So just in

closing out this item, then want to remind everyone including Members of the community who are still with us this evening and thank you for hanging with us as they say I please get comments, suggested edits, etc. Into staff. Someone told me that email address again s

3:00:14

f Reparations at SF gov dot o RG.

3:00:19

Awesome. Thank you so much. And Secretary Merrifield put that in the chat just one more time so that everyone sees it again, please get your recommendations, comments etc into staff by next Monday the 19th. So that there is opportunity to make, we will review and get the final version of the draft plan to the the powers that be Board of Supervisors Mayor's Office and the Human Rights Commission. We will also update everyone as we have clarity on timing data, etc. This will be in the new year but time and dates etc. Around presentations before said bodies, and then look to do the work that we've already talked about in terms of advocacy. So with that, we'll close this item, please call the next item.

3:01:18

7. RESOLUTION URGING THE SAN FRANCISCO BOARD OF SUPERVISORS TO ACCEPT THE DRAFT SAN FRANCISCO REPARATIONS PLAN *(Discussion and Possible Action Item)*

The San Francisco African American Reparations Advisory Committee will review and affirm the Resolution urging the San Francisco Board of Supervisors to accept the "Draft San Francisco Reparations Plan", in compliance with Ordinance NO. 259-20.

Presentation: **Brittni Chicuata**, Director, Economic Justice Division, San Francisco Human Rights Commission

Juell Stewart, Manager, Economic Justice Division, San Francisco Human Rights Commission

Public Comment

Committee Discussion

Item number seven is resolution urging the San Francisco Board of Supervisors to accept the draft San Francisco Reparations plan, discussion and possible action item. The San Francisco African American Reparations advisory committee committee will review and affirm the resolution urging the San Francisco Board of Supervisors to accept the draft San Francisco Reparations plan in compliance with ordinance number 259 dash two zero presentation by Brittni Chicuata, director of the economic Rights division, San Francisco Human Rights Commission Juell Stewart manager economic Rights division San Francisco Human Rights Commission, there will be public comment and committee discussion on this item.

3:02:07

Thank you so much. Director Chicuata returning to you,

3:02:12

thank you, um,

3:02:14

if my colleague could pull up the draft resolution. And so this is really just a pro forma item for you all to consider voting on this evening, which is a resolution that is required in the legislation that created this advisory committee to forward on to the clerk of the board of supervisors so that they may schedule a time in the new year where this body can appear in committee to discuss the draft Reppert Reparations plan. And so that is, you know, simply what this resolution is calling for, we would just submit it to the clerk of the board. And then, you know, Cathy Mulkey Meyer would follow up to schedule a date when this item would appear at the Board of Supervisors. And the way that the legislation is written that created the Reparations Advisory Committee, states that the board of supervisors must give, must vote on the San Francisco draft Reparations plan in order for it to move forward. So they have to either accept it or decline it or send it back to this body for feedback. And that is initiated through this resolution. Thank you.

3:03:38

Thank you, and just please correct me if I'm wrong about what I'm getting ready to say. But to kind of zoom in on the intention here, so that that everyone committee and community understand we want to ensure that the board take some action, that this doesn't become candidly another report, that gets acknowledged but goes nowhere. And so this is in the direction of trying to ensure that some action, even if it means sending it back to us is taken. So thank you for considering this. So with that, yeah, it's just

3:04:20

a it's a formal recognition of the draft report.

3:04:24

Thank you. Thank you very much for lifting that up. So we will go to public comment on this item and come back then to committee for any questions, discussion, and subsequently a vote. As we go to public comment, Members of community, again, want to invite you to share your public comment, specifically as it relates to the resolution. I know there are many other issues kind of circling around the report, et cetera. In this moment or window of public comment, we need to ask you to keep it focused on the resolution. As presented, we'd be happy to hear from you please public comment at this time.

3:05:06

If you would like to comment on the resolution, please use the raise hand icon. Public comment is three minutes on this item. Ship time carry. Well welcome.

3:05:22

Like to say really quickly, I support this resolution, but my only ask would be that committee and those who worked on the Reparations work in accordance with already existing advocacy around the dream keepers work for the mayor's office and Human Rights Commission so that we aren't zeroing out our efforts. And I don't know if that makes sense. But what I when I'm reading the report, I see some some aspects of dream keepers listed there, along with the Ask the Reparations committee, and I want us just to really be cautious and intentional about our advocacy so that we don't cancel both out. Thank you.

3:06:02

Thank you. Are there any other comments about the draft resolution, please use the raise hand icon or q&a feature. And again, this is just about the resolution as required by the ordinance. Virginia Marshall, welcome.

3:06:25

Here we go. Thank you so much. I support the resolution. I suppose I must have missed a meeting, that we this resolution was go to the board of supervisors and their approval that might come back to the committee and all that. So that's an extra step that I didn't realize, I thought the money was already had already been set aside. This is no Sunday and dance we have to do as a community. So I just hope that we all stay focus and go there together and let us know when the cons will come by. And large numbers have to be there in person as well as virtually. So again, thank you so much for the work.

3:07:07

Are there any other Members of the public would like to comment on the draft resolution? LaDonna Williams.

3:07:24

Yes, good evening. Again, I just wanted to say I fully support what you all are putting forth with this draft. And thank you so much for your commitment and dedication and hard work with the with this draft. Thank you.

3:07:42

Are there any other Members of the public would like to comment on the resolution? Okay, Chair, I do not see any other Members of the public who would like to comment on the resolution at this time.

3:07:56

Thank you so much saying none public comment is closed. And so we will come back to the committee. I would entertain a motion to adopt the resolution as presented.

3:08:08

I move Mr. Chairman that we adopted resolution as presented.

3:08:12

Thank you. Is there a second? Thank you. Second. Thank you Member ekanem. Secretary Mike, would you please roll call vote please.

3:08:22

Thank you chair. I will announce committee Members and names and they will announce that they support the resolution. Member Taylor Member Hollins, aye, Chair McDonald Member Dr. Reverend Brown Member Hamilton Member Cunningham. Member Barry. Member Landry Yes. Member Carter. Member Brown. Hi. Member acronym. Absolutely. Member Williams, aye. Member O'Kane Member Erving. Yes. Member Taylor's is available now. Yes. Yeah, Member. Okay. The motion has carried the resolution is accepted. That's it.

3:09:58

Thank you all very much. Let's Call the next item.

3:10:01

F

Item number eight is announcements. This is when committee Members and Members of the public may offer announcements for upcoming events, or other items relevant to the community. And again, this is just for announcing upcoming events. There will be public comment on this item.

3:10:22

Excellent. So again, to be clear, this is to announce upcoming events as we do in each of our meetings. So Members of the committee, upcoming events that you'd like to announce. Okay, seeing none reMember when were you trying to raise your hand? Okay. Yes, please.

3:10:47

Is this for announcements? Miss Chapman? Yes, sir. Thank you Miss javelin, I would like to announce that on the 19th at 530 at third Baptist Church, commission, Task Force advisory committee Member, brother Daniel Landrieu and I will be co hosting a meeting at third Baptist with the Police Department of Public Works. department or homelessness. The faith community save waste stores, all the businesses up and down that feel more Carter while we call in this meeting, so that we can have a gathering and meeting of the minds on what we must do to give our people an alternative to the despairing and dangerous conditions that exist there in that Safeway parking lot. People are doing federal them dedicating their tents all around the place that Safeway store now we learn spends about 35% of his security budget on that one store and this town situation gotten so bad that even the pastoral we're glad tidings church. There's not an African American church. Is that racial church? Yes. But led by the Pentecostal community, Pastor, his wife says she refuses to go back into Safeway. And that right there next to the heritage is building. So we must, in a positive, balanced way. Say that enough is enough. And all hands needed on deck so that even when we get some of these efforts to fruition, we will not win middle our community to just draw. Well, we will have workflow that's on the 19th at 530 at third Baptist Church, and all Members of Task Force are welcome to come and join us as we work I repeat to give our people alternatives to the despairs during situations that are going on in that parking lot. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

3:13:52

Thank you, Robin Brown, Director Davis. Oh, I just wanted to quickly say and Cathy can share maybe in the chat. I know. Chair McDonnell and Brittni and I've been talking about different ways to leverage events that are coming up. So this one is here as a part of the MLK event. We have Emily King globulin, Tango and the glide ensemble and minister Marvin white on January 12. To know January 13. To kick off MLK weekend and would love to follow up with the chair and vice chair about how to include Jared mentioned so just wanted to share that date we for sure will be passing out the bags and any other collateral and material from Reparations and probably just wanted to flag that date for folks January 13. At the herps theater, music and celebration I'm or at least recognition of the King holiday.

3:15:05

Thank you, Director Davis. ReMember Erving?

3:15:08

Thank you Chair McDonald. So as we know, or hopefully we know that Samsung Unified School District is disproportionate in the number of African American children they we I identify for special education in the areas of other health impairment and emotionally disturbed as well as the discipline rates. So we are in something called CSAs, comprehensive, coordinated early intervening services because of that disproportionality. We have convened a group, and it's called the educational partners, and we need the voices of families and community to come out and to hear some of the strategies that are being uplifted to use \$1.9 million to stop the over representation of Black children or over referrals for children who do not need to be in those categories. And so I have put the link in the chat, but I asked that the HRC makes it public. And the next upcoming meeting is January 9. There was one tonight, but the second meeting will be January 9, and you'll see the list of the other dates, we absolutely need to make sure we're speaking up for Black children. And Sampson Unified School District. So please join. Excuse me. Thank you reMember Erving Newbury? Yes, thank you

3:16:24

Chair. I wanted to double down on your announcement of the California State Reparations on Wednesday and Thursday. It'll be located in Oakland at their city hall starting at 9am on both days, and that's where folks heard about the \$200,000. That's a state accurate recommendation. So we definitely need to show up to support the state as well. And also. Information. Gotcha. Thank you for that breaking news.

3:17:07

But, but I had speak to that because this thing has taken place over the past 10 years is not even voted on such that somebody's speculation.

3:17:22

That's important information.

3:17:24

Thank you reverend. And also, I wanted to add education committee will be doing a listening session with the Black Student Unions with colleges and high schools in February. And if anybody would like to be on that committee to organize it, as well, Members of the public are invited, please contact Angelica, Human Rights Commission and get my information so they could be on the committee so that the people we're affecting with education can have input on our final report. Thank you.

3:18:00

Thank you, any other Members with announcements? For our share, just a couple additional. Okay, seeing no hands. Thank you, Member Landry for yours in the chat box, reiterating what Reverend Brown has already shared about the meeting on the 19th in the Safeway parking lot than the surrounding area. On the sit December 30, just FYI, is the deadline. For the changing the narratives, art campaigns. This is an opportunity for artists and want to be artists to submit graphic images or short

videos depicting the positive relationships between Black and Asian seniors and families. There are prizes. First place 7/52 Third place to 50 or \$50. That is for this honorary mentioned. So want to say that. Secondly, on January 12, is a tentative date around which and again, they'll be worked to confirm to a question number that you raised earlier, when might we make a presentation to the Human Rights Commission, that's a possible tentative date. So just to say that out loud and then related to the MLK celebrations on the 21st. There's an invitation to join the HRC contingent for the NorCal MLK march for them and am Cal train station. And then to be d are TBD, excuse me. Rules Committee. There will be again a date selected by them, not by us for presentation to the Rules Committee. So more to come on that. Lastly, just a reminder, so I've been put in the chatter a couple of times and maybe even do it again. But I Are we recruiting for the vacancy of seat number 15. And so we invite an individual who has lived or is currently living in public housing, to apply. And just to restate what we said earlier, if you applied in the past, we're asking you to apply again. So that we can complete this recruitment process and we welcome you to apply. So thank you. Okay. Oh, number Berry, please. Oh, that was No, Your hand was mistaken. Okay. All right. Excellent. Ron Brown, are you raising your hand? Members of

3:20:52

task force. We are to give way to the district. Dr. Davis. Because process and there's no surprise that she is net. The staff that will just commended in doing such an outstanding job.

3:21:22

Thank you, sir. If we were acquired, we'd start singing. But we're not. And so we won't. But we absolutely appreciate Dr. Davis and her leadership. Leadership can be both lonely and isolated, and not always celebrated. So we appreciate her leadership, Dr. Davis.

3:21:46

I was gonna say I you know, if folks didn't get to hear you sing yesterday, I know that you it's on Ubuntu from his sermon and his singing a glide on on yesterday. So he's saying twice, so you get to listen to him or four times you get to listen if you want to hear some singing. Thank you all.

3:22:08

The day. This man can shine.

3:22:11

Thank you, Dr. Davis. And Reverend Brown. Meanwhile, back to our regularly scheduled programming. Thank you for the announcements. Let's go to public comment, please. Madam Secretary.

3:22:24

I do see some Members of the public who are ready to participate in public comment. And I just want to remind everyone that it is three minutes, you're provided three minutes and welcome to Kenneth Johnson. Do you have any events or activities to share today? Or tonight? Can you unmute?

3:22:51

No, I just wanted to ask if you could put Eligibility List. Short backup.

3:23:03

Thank you. And I do see Virginia Marshall now.

3:23:12

I thank you so much. I just want to thank the committee Members in an invite and just like the public, because it's coming Friday, our school students in SF USD will begin they want to break beginning Monday for two weeks. And there I just want to applaud the dream people's funding Dr. Davis. And on Saturday, I just happened I plan to just drop in, as always do for just a moment at the cultural center 762 Oldham Street in LA Hill hutch, but I spent the whole day there. At the cultural center, the students had a train, they have all kinds of gangs and fairies. Well, of course, santafe. At Ella Hill hutch, there was a Black center, and all kinds of engaging activities for our students. And this coming Thursday as the as the in Bayview Hunters Point. They were there. I always enjoyed when I worked at Harvard, to watch the little kids run down the hill without gloves on going down the play of this play in the snow. And so I so I know that oh, your mind will have some activities too. So I just want to thank all the CEOs who go the extra step for our children, because many times every CBOs that I give children gifts, they may not get a Christmas gift or they might not get a hot meal. So these activities help. We can tell this kid was buddies with these organizations because these are three, two activities on Saturday one I will see this coming Thursday, helping stellar events for our students. So I want to thank you so much and happy Kwanzaa.

3:24:56

Thank you. Now I would like to welcome Linda Parker Pennington

3:25:07

thank you so much. And good evening, everyone. I just love listening to everyone. Thank you for your work. I just a couple of things I wanted to say thank you on behalf of the San Francisco Black and Jewish unity coalition. Thank you for cheering McDonald showing up for our celebration yesterday. And as some of you may know, the Unity coalition has been active in supporting the fight for Reparations. And we look forward to being your allies and the fight because it will take more than just us to make this happen. And so the Black and Jewish unity coalition stands ready to do whatever it takes to make this stick and have tea. And a couple of our Members, the Seligman and Robert Reinhart spoke earlier this evening, I want to say thank you to them. And we had a big teachin, Reverend Amos Brown was with us, as well as Eric McDonnell. And so I have heard Eric McDonnell saying, and I have as I told him, it was quite a shock to me to see him break into gospel, but that was fine. It was all good. So what I really wanted to say tonight, besides that, is, which is basically you know, we have your back. So just tell us our marching orders, is that from December 26, through January 1 is the 17th annual Kwanzaa celebration in San Francisco, run by the remarkable Adrian Williams of the village project. And so I have been going to this for it's probably 14 years. I was just 17 years. And the kickoff is December 26. And City Hall, I put the link in the chat for that at every event is free. Sometimes there's three or four events per day. So you can keep yourself pretty busy that week. And so if you can just come to even one of them. It is a remarkable education, a great time, often great food, great celebration, open to everyone. So with that I am complete. Thank you for your work. I really appreciate all that you're doing.

3:27:39

Thank you. And now I'd like to welcome Member of the public Nick Neely.

3:27:49

Hello, everyone. I am a wearable art artist here in San Francisco. Born and raised here. I am freedmen and Samoan descent. I have a wearable arts fashion show that is about envisioning us in the future of San Francisco. It is going to be in February for Paris, Texas, keeping in mind that you can kind of leave all carry on belongings. So there'll be an emergency evacuation.

3:28:19

There's lots of scattered pressure on. Continue.

3:28:26

Yes, please continue. Apologies. Okay,

3:28:29

no worries. Yes. So it is I'm trying to make it an annual event. It will be February 25, Bayview Opera House. It is a free event. Again, February have already booked the date. I am a wearable art artist specializing in metal, metal and textile art. And I really encouraged Members of the Reparations committee to come. Some of the Members have were there last year for my fashion show. And I would love to see anyone Members of the public come into the event again February 20. Next year for Black History Black futures month at the Bayview Opera House.

3:29:26

I have an event I would like to announce that I

3:29:29

saw your hand I was wondering if

3:29:34

that's all right. The Dream Keeper initiative in honor of Black History Month is hosting an all day dreaming futures event on February ninth. So I'll send all of you calendar invitations, at least to hold the date. But we are welcoming everybody who's watching and everybody who is of course on the record ratio advisory committee to actively participate in that event. Oh, and and now I actually do see a Member of the public has raised their hand

3:30:12

through the Chair, I do think that that is that event, there'll be reaching out to you all or to the Reparations advisory committee to participate in one of the panels or the breakouts. And so that's February 9.

3:30:25

Excellent, thank you. I'm sorry, Secretary Mulkey Meyer, who was remaining

3:30:31

with Melissa Jones, Garner. Okay.

3:30:35

Um, thank you, I just wanted to announce there is an event of a workshop at the San Francisco Public Library's a virtual event. And it's regarding San Francisco genealogy. Since many people in the in the community have expressed interest in delving into the genealogy and especially for this process, but even for your own edification, it's really important to know where we come from, because it will determine where we're going, whether we know our history or not. The workshop is Wednesday. It's this Wednesday, the 14th. From one to three, you can register at the S f p l.org. website, and believe it will, it will be held virtually as well. And the librarians will go through their expansive records. Also, as I put in the q&a, if you have a library card, and not just their school library card, but a library card for any city or county, you have access to many free benefits, including printing services, scanning document documents, if you have any accessibility needs, you have all all of that all all access to that for free. And also a free account with ancestry.com available to you through the public library. That is a benefit that was established many years ago, but very few people take advantage of. So I really just want to make sure that everybody was aware of that. And to utilize these resources while we still have access to them. Thank you.

3:32:24

Are there any other Members of the public who would like to participate in public comment at this time? Do you have an event to share? Please use the raise hand icon or q&a feature. Okay, I don't see any Members of the public who have events to share at this time.

3:32:44

Thank you so much seeing no public comment is closed. Let's call the second to last item on our agenda tonight, please.

3:32:52

9. ADOPTION OF THE OCTOBER 12, 2022, NOVEMBER 7, 2022, AND NOVEMBER 14, 2022 MEETING RECORDING AND TRANSCRIPTION (*Discussion and Possible Action Item*)

Review and anticipated adoption of video recording of the African American Reparations Advisory Committee's October 12, 2022, November 7, 2022, and November 14, 2022 meetings.

Public Comment

Committee Comment

Okay, item nine is adoption of the October 12 2020 November 7 2022 and November 14 2022, meeting recording and transcription. This is a discussion and possible action item review and the anticipated adoption of the video recording of the African Americans reparation advisory committees, October 12 2020 to November 7 2022 and November 14 2022 meetings. There will be public comment and committee comment. And I can post links in the chat to our SF gov website.

3:33:34

Excellent. Thank you. So Members of public we're going to come to you for public comment on this item and then Dagon the item is to approve the meeting Trump's gifts for three meetings October 12 on

November 7, and November 14, and then we'll return to committee for discussion and vote. Possible vote that's got a public comment, please.

3:33:59

I was muted. Are there any other Members of the public who would like to comment on the video recordings and transcriptions of the previous meetings please use the raise hand icon or q&a feature. I do not see any Members of the public who'd like to comment on that at this time Chair. Thank you

3:34:22

Seeing none public comment Elston one person,

3:34:25

one person just raise their hand public Member McNealy. Hello again.

3:34:36

So this is just so the public can have transcript transcripts of past meetings. Am I correct?

3:34:45

No, ma'am. This is there are transcripts made for each meeting. And so this is approving the transcripts from prior meetings.

3:34:52

Okay. All right. Thank you.

3:34:57

Are there any other Members of the public would like to comment. Okay, Chair, I do not see any other Members of the public would like to comment on that

3:35:07

public comment again. Thank you so much. Committee Members, I can entertain a motion please to accept the November 14 transcription. Can we do them all at once? Do we have to do them separately?

3:35:23

And did it again, we can do them all at once.

3:35:26

Fantastic. So Members, I would entertain a motion to approve the October 12, November 7, and November 14th. Recording and transcriptions. So, second sogard. Thank you. Thank you. Thank you. Excuse me. For the motion and seconded. Is there any objection to approval? Hearing none, that by unanimous consent, transcript recordings and transcriptions are approved. With that we are now at adjournment. Just before I entertain a vote, I just want to acknowledge and thank again, Members of community who show up consistently and hang with us for these sometimes long meetings. So we appreciate you appreciate your partnership in this effort. And then again to our HRC amazing staff, this

team of supports, both in the work offline, but and also the work online when we are in meetings. And then lastly, to each of my colleagues on the committee, thank you so much for your continued thoughtful leadership. Is there a motion to adjourn?

3:36:36

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

A motion to adjourn. Fantastic. Thank

3:36:39

you Vice Chair Hollins. Is there a Second. Second, thank you Member Carter and Member Brown. I'm assuming everybody seconds that one. If there's no objection by acclamation we will adjourn tonight's meeting. Thank you all so much for your time and attention. Everyone. Have a fabulous evening.

3:36:56

Happy Holidays y'all.